**Inquiry Report**

**On**

**Professional Misconduct by UCPO Ms. Musfira in Sindh-West Karachi-Baldia-Nai Abadi – 4**

**Inquiry Report by:**

**CHIP Training & Consulting Pvt. Ltd.**

**Submitted to:**

**WHO-PO**

Contents

[1. Background 3](#_Toc96787232)

[1.1 Allegations: 3](#_Toc96787233)

[2. Methodology 3](#_Toc96787234)

[3. Key Findings 4](#_Toc96787235)

[4. Conclusion 5](#_Toc96787236)

[5. Recommendations 5](#_Toc96787237)

# 1. Background

On February 21st 2022, an investigation report was shared by Program Team based on two different complaints against UCPO Ms. Musfira first on account of consensual relationship with TDOSO Mr. Tauheed and second on account of abuse of authority. On 30th January 2022, Ms. Musfira made a complaint against TCO Mr. Bakht Naseer on Personalization, Immoral Allegations, and Favoritism. Later, on 14th February 2022 a detailed report was shared by her Area Coordinator Dr. Omar along with Dr. Maheen (IO) and Mr. Rooh ul Amin (DCO), where he stated that UCPO Ms. Musfira falsely accused TCO Mr. Bakht Naseer *(attached as Annex C).*

## 1.1 Allegations:

Following are the key accusations.

1. UCPO Ms. Musfira and TDOSO Mr.Tauheed have violated the workplace code of ethics because of their allegedly romantic involvement (attached as Annex A).
2. According to AS Ms. Nazia, UCPO Ms. Musfira shouted and insulted her in front of Mr. Shujaat and Mr. Tauheed for not addressing her by Ma’am a day before in the WhatsApp group. She has made Ms. Nazia her prime target and pressurizes her by threatening her over transfer or termination (attached as Annex D and B respectively).
3. AS Ms. Nazia in her statement revealed that Ms. Musfira posed a question on her character when she stayed at the hospital (TSC) late for data submission and also insulted her on many occasions (Attached as Annex B)
4. As per AS Ms. Nazia, UCPO Ms. Musfira also criticized and body-shamed her in-front of all the field staff (attached as Annex B).
5. Area Coordinator Mr. Omar mentioned in his email that UCPO Ms. Musfira falsely accused Mr. Bakht Naseer for Personalization, Immoral Allegations, and Favouritism (attached as Annex C).

In response to the above complaints, UCPO Ms. Musfira was issued a suspension on an immediate basis (attached as Annex E). In her statement of defense UCPO Ms. Musfira penned down that one day during the MR Campaign, Ms. Nazia was dressed inappropriately on which Supervisor Ms. Saiqa and UCOO Ms. Asma counseled her. When it came to her knowledge, she admonished Ms. Nazia calmly regarding her attire but Ms. Nazia became livid and started yelling. Further, she added that a year ago Ms. Nazia created an issue that resulted in the transfer of the previous UCPO Mr. Adeel. Still, she has not changed and now repeating the same with me (attached as Annex F).

# 2. Methodology

In order to analyze the situation, a field visit to UC 4 – Nai Abadi was conducted to carry out individual meetings with the below-mentioned staff and collected their written statements:

* UCPO Ms. Musfira
* AS Ms. Nazia (Complainant)
* CHW’s Statements
* Area Supervisors’ Statements
* UCOO Ms. Asma Malik
* TCO Mr. Bakht Naseer
* UCOO Shujaat Ali Khan

A statement signed by a number of CHWs and audio messages were also obtained.

# 3. Key Findings

1. As per the compliant (attached as Annex A), regarding UCPO Ms. Musfira and TDOSO Mr.Tauheed having consensual relationship and polluting the environment. No substantial evidence regarding this complaint was found. All the CHWs including UCOO and TCO have confirmed that there is no such relationship between Mr. Tauheed and Ms. Musfira (attached as Annex N, Annex I, Annex J and Annex O respectively). However, a few commented that they have seen them talking to each other for long hours but nothing more has been witnessed (attached as Annex M). UCOO Mr. Shujaat Ali Khan further added that he hasn’t seen anything of such type between Ms. Musfira and Mr. Tauheed but every time a complaint was made about Ms. Musfira to Mr. Tauheed she was being informed and the next day she chides them for making compliant against her (attached as Annex I).
2. Few field staff statements indicate that, it was Ms. Nazia who previously had some kind of relationship with Mr. Tauheed (attached as Annex G, Annex H, Annex P, and Annex Q). During the interview, it came to our knowledge that both Ms. Nazia and Ms. Musfira were friends once. Due their personal issues, they have created a hostile environment in the UC. These issues are escalating day by day as both of them are not dealing with it professionally.
3. According to AS Ms. Nazia’s statement, UCPO Ms. Musfira called her out over not addressing her as “Ma’am” in the WhatsApp group. TCO Mr. Bakht Naseer also seconded this and said that Ms. Musfira got a bit personal in the group chat (attached as Annex D and Annex O) and by the same token, UCPO Ms. Musfira kept on mentioning Ms. Nazia in the group for not replying, knowing that she is on sick leave (attached as Annex D). However, according to UCOO Ms. Asma Malik while collecting micro plans, Ms. Musfira’s first question regarding that was about Ms. Nazia’s plan, immediately after that she mentioned her in the group and also asked Ms. Asma to point Ms. Nazia out for this (attached as Annex J).
4. UCPO Ms. Musfira rudely addressed Area Supervisors in the WhatsApp group, about staying late at the center. This reflects her bossy attitude and how she deals with the staff in the field. Additionally, Ms. Musfira has indirectly targeted the characters of area supervisors (voice recording attached as Annex J). UCOO Mr. Shujaat Ali Khan in his statement recorded that UCPO Ms. Musfira have insulted her on many occasions in field in-front of the community and also in the team support center (attached as Annex I and Annex L).
5. UCOO Ms. Asma reported the incident in her statement where she guided Ms. Nazia on wearing her bag properly but when Ms. Musfira came to know about the incident she became furious and started yelling at Ms. Nazia. According to UCOO Ms. Asma, Ms. Musfira also insisted her to use harsh words with Ms. Nazia (attached as Annex J). UCCO Mr. Shujaat’s and 1 other statement also tell us that Ms. Musfira criticized Ms. Nazia on her dressing and physical appearance (attached as Annex I & Annex M respectively).
6. It is evident from the statements we received from the field staff that AS Ms. Nazia’s dressing is inappropriate given the environment of the field (attached as Annex G and Annex P). Keeping in view Mr. Adeel’s statement (Ex UCPO of the UC) it can be concluded that it is not the first time someone pointed it out and still she hasn’t put any effort correcting her ways (attached as Annex Q).
7. According to UCPO Ms. Musfira’s complaint, TCO Mr. Bakht Naseer is allegedly involved in Personalization, Immoral Allegations, and Favoritism. On the contrast when the matter was probed by her Area Coordinator Dr. Omar along with Dr. Maheen (IO) and Mr. Rooh ul Amin (DCO), all the allegations lacked objectivity in terms of date of occurrence and place because of which the allegations that she leveled against Mr. Bakht Naseer could not be established (attached as Annex C).

# 4. Conclusion

Following is the diagnosis of the investigation derived from our findings.

1. No substantial evidence in favor of Ms. Musfira and Mr. Tauheed’s alleged romantic involvement was found.
2. It is evident from the findings that there is a personal tussle between Ms. Musfira and Ms. Nadia and they are giving each other a tough time. However, being UC lead, Ms. Musfira should have dealt with it professionally but due to her bossy nature and harsh attitude, she failed to handle it pragmatically. It is further established that Ms. Musfiraa used harsh words and exhibited rude behavior with staff members. In her rage, she sometimes also threatened staff members with transfers and terminations (attached as Annex J and I)
3. Ms. Musfira’s complaint regarding TCO Mr. Bakht Naseer could not be established as she failed to provide any tangible evidence (attached as Annex C).
4. It is also observed that there is grouping and lobbying in the UC due to which firstly the staff was reluctant to talk about the UC issues and but after assurances of not revealing their names, they opened up.

By keeping in view all the people we interview and the testimonies we received, it can be proved that there is a lack of one team approach in the UC team which resulted into this entire plight and hindered the smooth running of UC operations.

# 5. Recommendations

After carefully analyzing the entire situation it is safe to say that both UCPO Ms. Musfira and AS Ms. Nazia are at fault as they are letting their personal issues get mixed with their professional lives, as a result of which they are targeting each other at the workplace. We would recommend that both of them should be transferred out of their district, so that none of them will be able to flaunt their monopoly of being able to transfer the other one. Hopefully this action will help them learn the valuable lesson of working together as team.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Suggestion/ Recommendation** | **Responsibility** | **Deadline** |
| Issue a final warning to the UCPO Ms. Musfira on account of unprofessional attitude. CTC will conclude her contract if any issue is reported against her in the future. | CTC | Immediate  |
| Transfer UCPO Ms. Musfira from current UC to another district | CTC in consultation with WHO Provincial Office | After conclusion of NIDs Mar 2022 |
| Transfer/ reshuffling of AS Ms. Nazia  | Third Party Vendor in consultation with DEOC and EOC | After the conclusion of NIDs Mar 2022 |