**Inquiry Report**

**On**

**Unprofessional or casual attitude**

**UC: Hazar Khwani-2, Tehsil SMT**

**District Peshawar,**

**Inquiry Report by:**

**CHIP Training & Consulting Pvt. Ltd.**

**Submitted to:**

**WHO-PO**

**Contents**

[**1.** **Introduction:** 3](#_Toc90567484)

[**2.** **Background:** 3](#_Toc90567486)

[**3.** **Mthodology** 4](#_Toc90567487)

[**4.** **Investigation:** 4](#_Toc90567488)

**5. Findings……**………………………………………………………………………………………5

**6. Recommendations…**……………………………… ……………………………………….5

1. **Introduction**.

A complaint was received against Ms. Savera Ali holding CNIC [1730182786952] working as CHW in SMT-HAZARKHWANI-2 on account of fake data reporting **[Annex-A]**

Approval was received dated 2nd December, 2023 **[PTL Approval is attached as Annex-B]**

1. **Background**

CHW Sawera was suspended by the program team on account of fake data reporting. The CTC Management recommended issuing show cause letter to the mentioned staff dated 5th December, 2023 **[Show cause is attached as Annex-C]**

Response of show cause letter was received from the CHW on 6th December, 2023. Ms. Savera Ali stated in her response that she denied all allegations leveled against her. With four years of experience as a CHW, she strongly denies engaging in unprofessional practices. Requesting an inquiry, she expresses the need for a verbal discussion to fully convey the facts **[Annex – D].** The response Ms. Savera Ali was shared with the concerned AC/IO for feedback in which AC recommended the case for proper investigation as per request of Ms. Sawera

**[Annex-E]**

1. **Methodology**.

The case was investigated by a field visit to the UC. The investigation team conducted one-on-one sessions with CHW, AS, UCOOs and also interrogated CHW Sawera and took her stance. The stance of the complainant was also taken and recorded in this report

**Annex-E:** Statement by UCOO Sidra

**Annex-F:** Statement by UCOO Junaid

**Annex-G:** Statement by AS Shaheen

**Annex-H:** Statement by CHW Sawera

1. **Investigation:**

The investigation team visited UC on 15th December 2023 at 10 A.M. A detailed conversation was conducted with different staff members.

**Statement by UCOO Junaid:**

UCOO Junaid Jashed reported discrepancies in the NID campaign coverage, specifically regarding CHW Sawera. Upon validating the covered NA instances, the following findings were identified:

On Day #1, a child at House #4 was recorded as NA and included in CHW coverage, later discovered as unvaccinated on Day #2 in CHW Razia's area.

Children Ulfat and Atta at House #90 were initially recorded as NA and covered; however, post-validation revealed inconsistencies through finger work validation.

At House #69 on Day #2, child Savera was included in coverage but was not present at home.

House #114 documented Zeba and Savera as NA, covered on the same day, but the child received vaccination on Day 3 morning by team R, raising concerns about the advanced coverage data provided by the team.

In the case of House #73, child Ayesha was marked as NA (Lock House), covered, but the house was confirmed as still locked.

These issues were investigated by AS Shaheen by the end of the day. Additionally, in House #174, a child recorded as NA and covered was found unvaccinated upon visit. Similarly, House #137 noted two children, Abuzar and Iqra, as NA (lock house), but the house was observed as locked upon visit. Videos and pictures substantiating these findings were shared via email.

**Statement by UCOO Sidra:**

UCOO Sidra Qamar highlighted concerns from the recent campaign, indicating that AS Shaheen reported instances of fake coverage by CHW Savera. On Day 2, AS Shaheen informed UCOO Junaid that, upon verification of CHW Savera's Day 1 activities, discrepancies were found—children reported in coverage were not actually covered. Similarly, on the 3rd day, while verifying the second day's data, 8 children were listed in coverage but were not covered.

On catch-up Day 1 in Area 11, during back day coverage with AS, House 173's children, Ansar and Atta ur Rehman, reported as covered by Sawera, were vaccinated by AS in her presence. The house residents claimed the children returned home the previous night. Additionally, on Day 1, child Rukia, covered by Sawera, was documented in CHW Razia Bagi's guest sheet on Day 2, indicating a coverage error. House occupants stated they visited Sohailabad, where another CHW provided vaccine to the child.

Furthermore, House #161, with children Razaq and Javed recorded in Sawera's coverage, was contradicted by the roaming team who vaccinated the children while they were at a local bazaar in their area. These discrepancies raise concerns about the accuracy of the reported coverage data.

**Statement by AS Shaheen:**

AS Shaheen reported discrepancies in the OBR campaign, where a temporary team's statement revealed that CHW Sawera claimed coverage for 4 children already covered by the temporary team. Although lacking concrete proof, AS Shaheen sensed issues within her team. In the NID campaign, on Day 1, she identified an unvaccinated girl in CHW Razia's area covered as a guest. She promptly contacted UCDO Junaid, who advised her to scrutinize Day 2's work for similar issues. After CHW Sawera shared the NA coverage sheet, AS Shaheen discovered 8 children recorded as covered but not vaccinated. UCOO Junaid issued a show cause letter to CHW Sawera on Day 3.

During catch-up Day 1, residents informed AS Shaheen that CHW Sawera inquired about other visitors, suggesting knowledge of the reported fake coverage. With UCDO Sidra, AS Shaheen visited three houses, vaccinated a child in House #173, and recorded a video as evidence. These actions were taken to address the identified discrepancies and ensure accurate reporting in subsequent campaigns.

**Statement by CHW Savera:**

CHW Sawera expresses dissatisfaction with the working environment, asserting that tasks are assigned based on the will of UCDOs and AS. She claims that UCOO Junaid threatens and insults staff regularly, while AS involves them in personal tasks. She reported against AS in a previous campaign, leading to tensions and personal conflicts. Sawera alleges mistreatment during her miscarriage, claiming leave denial and deduction in salary. Additionally, she accuses UCOO Junaid of taking money from her during her absence, citing a family connection as the reason.

Sawera denies engaging in fake coverage, blaming AS and UCOO for orchestrating the allegations due to fear of her reporting. She points out the need for a fair inquiry involving all CHWs to clear any misunderstandings. She claims to have faced threats to her life from refusal home residents and accuses AS of not allowing her to visit certain homes.

Moreover, Sawera highlights restrictions on communication with ALSM and the practice of putting refusal cases under ALSM's responsibility. She shares instances where AS instructed her to mark a refusal house but later criticized her for revisiting the case. She also mentions dissatisfaction with the assigned supervisor in the recent campaign.

1. **Findings**

Based on the investigation proceedings, following are the key findings.

The below mentioned Statements are truly based on ground realities/field verification and Household Statements.

* HH 69

The House Was Locked, After Ward The House Got Open Met Household Men He Told That At The Moment Child Along With Mother Went To Doctor, During Vaccination Time The Men Was Not Available At Home. Today Met With Child Mother, She Told That HH 69, 80 And 90 Are Relatives, The Child Went With HH 80 And 90 Family And All Children Were Vaccinated At Al Khidmat Hospital.

* HH 73

The House Was Locked At The Moment, Pic Is Shared Of Locked House.

The Grand Mother House Is Located Near By And Proceeded To Inquire And Stated That Team Has Vaccinated The Child At Home.

* HH 80

The House Was Also Locked, The Concern Household Sister Is Near By To Her, She Was At Sister House, Proceeded And Investigated At Her Sister House. According To House Hold The Child Went To Al-Khidmat Hospital And The Child Was Vaccinated At Al-Khidmat Hospital.

* HH 90

Same As Above HH 80 Statement These Both Sisters Went To Al-Khidmat Hospital And Children Vaccinated At Al-Khidmat Hospital Of HH 80 And 90.

* HH 114

According To Household The Family Is Shifted But The Child Was Vaccinated By Team In House.

* HH 161

According To Mother Statement The Child On Daily Basis Goes With His Father, Father Is Scrap Dealer At Gujjar Abad, And The Child Is Also Admitted In Madrassa Near His Father Go Down. According To Mother Statement the CHW Went to Gujjar Abad Go down and Vaccinated the Child at Go down/Madrassa. Father Number Demanded But Was Not Available With Mother.

* HH 173

According To Household Statement The Child Was NA In 1st Visit, In 2nd Visit The CHW Came And Took The Child Out For Vaccination. On Next Day Some One Came To the Said House and Took the Child Out and the Child Came Back To Home.

* HH 174

According To Household Statement The Child Was At Shaheed Abad, On Same Day Evening Time 1 Male And 2 Females Came In Evening And Vaccinated The Child By Mobile Torch.

* NO Fake vaccination Have Been Recorded from Any House during Investigation.

1. **Recommendation**

No fake data reporting against CHW Sawera is proved therefore no action is recommended