|  |
| --- |
|  |
| **Investigation Report** |
|  |
| **On Misuse of Authority of UCOO Malka**  **Date of Complaint: 16 January 2024** |
|  |
| **Report by: CHIP Training and Consulting** |

1. **Introduction:**

A complaint was initially received against Malka working as a UCOO at Korangi – Bilal Colony-1 regarding her financial misconduct. It was reported that an ATM card of a worker namely Uzma who is working as Area Supervisor was stolen and Rs. 20,000 was withdrawn from her account. It was alleged that the UCOO stole the card and gave it to another Area Supervisor namely Mehwish to withdraw the money. When Mehwish came to know that the ATM card belongs to Uzma, she returned the money and ATM to AS Uzma and also apologized to her. She told Uzma that the ATM was given to her by the UCOO who asked her to withdraw the money. The UCOO got furious over this and in retaliation, she forced Uzma to register FIR against Mehwish for stealing her card which Uzma refused.

Later, the UCOO started harassing Mehwish and hold a personal grudge against her. The UCOO pressurized her to the extent that the worker was forced to resign from her services. It was later revealed that the resignation was later retracted by Mehwish however, the UCOO shared the same for onward action thus misused her authority.

The matter was immediately referred for investigation and Malka was suspended from her duties with clear instructions to avoid any interaction with the fellow workers. It was later reported that Malka not only invited the staff at her residence but also threatened them for dire consequences.

1. **Chargesheet**

The UCOO was charged with the following allegations;

* 1. Stealing the ATM card and withdraw cash through Mehwish.
  2. Forced Uzma to register FIR against Mehwish.
  3. Harassed Mehwish out of personal grudges.
  4. Retaliated against Mehwish and provoke her sister to verbally and physically abuse Mehwish.
  5. Violated the terms of suspension and threatened the staff to obstruct the smooth process of investigation.

1. **Methodology**

In order to probe the matter, the CTC team conducted a fact-finding investigation of the matter. Individual meetings with AS Mehwish, AS Uzma, CHW Ghazala and UCOO Malka were conducted in the CTC regional office Karachi to acquire their stances. The details of the statements of the Staff are attached as following Annexures.

* Statement of AS Uzma Annex-B
* Statement of AS Mehwish Annexure C.
* Statement of AS Rafia Annexure D.
* Statement of UCOO Malka Annex-E
* Statement of CHW Ghazala Annexure F.

1. **Statements**

The following are the key facts from the statements of the staff:

**Statement of AS Mehwish:**

AS Mehwish stated that the UCOO provided her with an ATM card and instructed her to withdraw money from the account before coming to TSC. Mehwish followed these instructions, withdrew the money. However, upon learning that the ATM was stolen, she returned both the money and the card to AS Uzma. The UCOO got furious over this and started pressurizing and threatening her by mentioning her sister who are working in the police department. Consequently, Mehwish could not succumb to the pressure and submitted her resignation to a colleague. The colleague counselled her and advised her to revert her resign. Mehwish stated that she decided to change her decision and continue her work. However, Malka who knew that Mehwish had retracted her resigned, managed to get the letter from the colleague and send it to CTC for acceptance. Additionally, Mehwish accused CHW Ghazala, the sister of UCOO Malka for physically and verbally abusing her. A show cause was also given to AS Mehwish, questioning why she withdrew money from another account, to which she replied that she simply followed her UCOO's orders, as she could not deny the instructions given by UCOO.

**Statement of AS Uzma:**

According to the statement from AS Uzma, on January 15, 2024, her ATM was stolen, and 20,000 rupees were withdrawn from her account. AS Mehwish returned the money on the same evening to Uzma. According to her statement, the next day, upon arriving at the TSC, UCOO Malka forced her to file an FIR against Mehwish. AS Uzma further mentioned that Malka pressurized AS Mehwish to resign from the job and instructed all the staff not to communicate with Mehwish. Uzma also mentioned that Malka warned all the workers that she would file a complaint against them if they communicate with Mehwish. Uzma further stated that Mehwish sent her resignation to another CHW Rafia, but both Rafia and she advised Mehwish not to resign to which Mehwish agreed. According to her, they told Malka that Mehwish has changed her decision, but despite the fact, Malka took their mobile phones, captured screenshot of the chats, and directed them to inform Mehwish that her resignation had been accepted. Uzma also stated that Malka has given clear instructions to not allow Mehwish to come in the field.

**Statement of CHW Rafia:**

As per her statement, UCOO Malka behavior is inappropriate towards the staff. She also stated that none of them can leave the UC without the permission of Malka so how AS Mehwish could leave the area without her permission. She stated that Malka harass the staff mentally. Rafia confirms that Malka took her mobile phone and took screenshot of her chat with Mehwish and blocked her number on both whatsapp and phone. She also mentioned that Mehwish had retracted her resigned but Malka forcibly took screenshot of the chat related to Mehwish’s resign and told that Mehwish resign has been accepted.

**Statement of CHW Ghazala:**

Ghazala was issued show cause to which she stated that she never misbehaved with anyone and refused to accept any allegation. She was again given a chance in personal hearing at CTC office in which she admitted that she had misbehaved with Mehwish but never physically abuse her. She also apologized for her mistakes and stated that she will not repeat her mistakes in future.

**Statement of UCOO Malka**

UCOO Malka was called for personal hearing to rebut the charges but she denied all the allegations leveled against her. She stated that she neither gave ATM card of AS Uzma to Mehwish and nor threatened her about filing police case. She also refused to accept that she harassed Mehwish and forced her to reigned and shared her resignation despite the fact that Mehwish had retracted the same. She stated that it has been planned by the staff who are non-local and are habitual of leaving field early. When inquired whether she reported such issues to CTC, Malka was unable to give any satisfactory answer.

During investigation, it was found that Malka while suspended, had invited all the staff to her residence however, there is no evidence to suggest whether such meeting took place or not. Malka refused any such meeting but stated that a meeting was held at DC Office by IO Kanwal but it was a normal meeting.

Regarding concealment of kinship, both Malka and Ghazala have stated that they are working in the same UC but Ghazala is not under the direct supervision of Malka so they have not declared their kinship in the Kinship Declaration Form.

1. **Findings**

The allegations of abuse of authority and harassing workers are both red line issues and mark for zero tolerance. The investigation shows that Malka had in fact abuse her authority on multiple occasions and violated the SOPs. The conduct of Malka during investigation was also not cooperative and she had failed to justify her position in a plausible manner.

The ATM card of AS Uzma was stolen which created panic within the polio workers. When Mehwish found out that the ATM card was stolen, she gave the money and ATM card to Uzma and told her that Malka gave her this card to withdraw money. It is not clear who stole the ATM but the ATM was given to Mehwish by Malka and instructed her to withdraw money. Malka upon knowing that Mehwish had told Uzma about her misconduct, decided to take revenge. Malka used her influence and told Uzma to file a complaint against Mehwish for stealing the ATM card. AS Uzma refused to follow her instructions as she knew who had stolen her ATM card and the fact that Mehwish was innocent.

Thereafter, Malka started harassing Mehwish to settle her personal score. Mehwish decided to resign under pressure and send the same to Rafia but later change her mind after being counselling by Uzma and Rafia. Malka who knew about of resignation forcibly took Rafia’s cell phone and forwarded messages to her number and then send it to CTC for acceptance. (Attached as Annex – G, H and I) It was clearly told to Malka that Mehwish had retracted her resign but Malka was adamant on her resignation and told all the workers that Mehwish will not be allowed in the field. Later, Malka had also provoked her sister Ghazala who had verbally abused Mehwish in front of other workers. Ghazala had admitted the charges and sought pardon.

The stance of Malka was taken via show cause and she was also provided a personal hearing to prove her innocence. Though Malka had denied the allegations but failed to clarify her position in a satisfactory manner. She also failed to respond to her sister’s admitting verbally abusing Mehwish on her instigation. Malka was also inquired about her pressurizing Uzma to register FIR against Mehwish to which Malka was unable to respond. Malka insisted that these workers are habitual later comers and non-locals and are against her. When Malka was inquired whether she reported any of these workers to CTC for said issues, she was silent.

Therefore, the investigation shows that Malka had not only threatened Mehwish and created a toxic work environment for her which led her to resign. Malkahad also abused her authority by sending resign of Mehwish to CTC despite the fact that she knew it that Mehwish had reverted the same. Malka had abused her authority to threaten the entire staff member to not allow Mehwish in the field. The conduct of Malka has damaged the workplace environment and demoralize other workers as well. Malka had violated the red line issues and is liable to be proceeded under the disciplinary framework.

Both Malka and Ghazala had also violated the kinship policy which requires all the staff members to declare their kinship in the kinship declaration form. The concealment of kinship within the program is also a red line issue and liable for contract termination.

The supporting documents are listed as follows;

* 1. Disclosure of Relationship – Ghazala
  2. Disclosure of Relationship – Malka

1. **Recommendations:** 
   1. It is recommended that the contract of UCOO Malka be terminated for harassing her subordinate staff and abusing her authority.
   2. The CHW Ghazala has apologized for her mistake therefore, a lenient action is recommended and she may be awarded with a final warning.