

Investigation Report

On

COMPLAINT BY THE AREA SUPERVISORS

Inquiry Report by:

CHIP Training & Consulting Pvt. Ltd.

Submitted to:

WHO-PO

Contents

1. Introduction3

1.1 Allegations3

2. Methodology.....4

3. Key findings4

4. Conclusion:6

5. Recommendations7

1. Introduction:

An explanation was issued to two Area Supervisors namely Basaria and Zeenat working in UC Chiltan-1 on account of unprofessional attitude on 27 Feb, 2024. In response, the two AS levelled allegations on TDOSO Shahid Raza and UCSP Israr that they are biased against them and their behavior towards them is highly improper. The AS Basaria further alleged that the TDOSO is taken decisions alone and shuffling the teams including her team which is creating so many issues such as refusals and NA. The AS Basaria further alleged that she received warning for those issues which were created by the TDOSO. The AS Basaria stated that the TDOSO has humiliated her on multiple occasions and the workplace environment is highly toxic and she is working under mental stress and fear. Subsequently, when issues arose in Basria's area due to shuffling among team members, TDOSO Mr. Shahid Raza unjustly accused her of falsifying data regarding refusals, despite evidence that the increased refusals were due to genuine health issues of children. Additionally, Basria highlighted inconsistencies in treatment, noting that while she was reprimanded for refusals, other colleagues, such as Zubeda, faced no repercussions for similar issues. Basria's concerns were further compounded when her request for emergency leave during a campaign was rejected.

According to the stance of Zeenat, during a separate incident in November-NID, she arrived late for a meeting by 10 minutes, for which she apologized to UCOO Ms. Sania. UCSP Israr was also present their but he remained silent. However, during a subsequent field activity, UCSP Israr misbehaved with her regarding her tardiness. Zeenat reported this to UCOO Ms. Sania, who advised her against confronting the individuals involved, citing potential repercussions from TDOSO Mr. Shahid Raza and UCSP Mr. Israr.

The allegations were of serious nature and constitutes violations of the SOPs and hence needs to be addressed through investigation. However, as the complainants have levelled serious allegations, the matter pertaining to their disciplinary matter was put on hold till the conclusion of this investigation.

1.1 Allegations:

- a. Unfair and inappropriate conduct of TDOSO Mr. Shahid Raza, UCSP Mr. Israr, and UCOO Ms. Sania.
- b. The issuance of disciplinary letter issued to her without proper explanation.
- c. Shuffling teams without her consent leading to difficulties in managing and supporting them effectively.
- d. Creating toxic workplace environment.

The complaint by AS Ms. Basaria AS Ms. Zeenat are attached as Annex A and Annex B respectively.

2. Methodology:

CTC conducted a comprehensive inquiry involving field visits to UC Chilton-1. The investigation focused on interviewing AS Farzana & Fozia and UCOO Sania, TDOSO Mr. Shahid Raza alongside other staff, to gather evidence regarding the allegations.

Annex C: Statement of TDOSO Mr. Shahid Raza.

Annex D: Statement of AS Ms. Farzana.

Annex E: Statement of AS Ms. Fozia.

Annex F: Statement of UCOO Ms. Sania

Annex G: Complaint Against CHW Basria on account of her Unprofessional Attitude

3. Key findings:

The key findings of the Investigation Committee are mentioned as below.

a. Statement of TDOSO Shahid Raza

TDOSO denied all allegations made by AS Basria and stated that he has no personal issues with the complainants. He mentioned that AS Basria has a history of unprofessional attitude and poor performance. The TDOSO stated that she has misbehaved with him on various occasions. He also said that she has been reported for other issues as well including absenteeism from important activities, insubordination etc. Additionally, he reported an incident where AS Basria allegedly tore her own MP, which led TDOSO Shahid to report her to the IO via email. The facts stated by the TDOSO are also substantiated as the Basaria has been reported for attitude and poor performance and the instant

complaint is also originated as a response to the explanation issued to her for her unprofessional attitude.

b. Statement of AS Farzana

In order to ensure that the conduct of TDOSO is professional, the feedback of other staff member was also taken. The AS Farzana stated that the conduct of Shahid is good and he maintains professionalism. However, she noted that he is strict regarding work-related matters. Additionally, she has no issues with AS Basria. When her father-in-law fell ill, she visited Dhadar and shared a video with UCOO Sania. Farzana indicated her lack of awareness regarding any issues concerning AS Basria.

c. Statement of AS Fozia

The Area Supervisor Fozia stated in her statement that she never noticed any issues with TDOSO Shahid Raza, UCOO Sania, and UCSP Israr, but she witnessed the unprofessional attitude of AS Basria. She also noted Basria's frequent absence from activities. Fozia recalled being present when Basria misbehaved with TDOSO Shahid Raza regarding shuffling. Additionally, AS Basria misbehaved with Shahid whenever he asked her to cover refusals. On one occasion, AS Fozia visited Basria's area where a household refused vaccination and another household refused to vaccinate from one of Basria's team members along with UCOO Sania, but AS Basria later claimed that Shahid was only questioning her about refusals. On the other hand, AS Zeenat has no issues, as she is punctual, performs her work properly, and doesn't misbehave with others. AS Zeenat is also a friend of AS Basria.

d. Statement of UCOO Sania

The UCOO Sania stated that since her deployment, she has faced issues with AS Basaria. On one occasion, AS Basaria submitted a fake micro plan and reacted poorly when questioned, even tearing up her micro plan. Despite being reported for this behavior, no action was taken against her. UCOO Sania assigned the G2 area to AS Basaria due to issues in covering G1, although there were no issues in the G1 area aside from her failure to visit her teams there, which she now repeats in the G2 area. AS Basria's weak supervision skills became evident when UCOO Sania found issues in her area and received

marking issues were discovered during validation in AS Basria's area, indicating her teams were providing fake data. Due to these issues, AS Basria's teams were shuffled to another area, where she subsequently misbehaved with TDOSO Shahid Raza and failed to assist the newly shuffled teams. During NID January 2024, it was found that AS Basria's old teams were engaging in fake finger marking. UCOO Sania took AS Basria and her team to cover a refusal house, which had shown cover in the last campaign, resulting in 40 refusals being recorded. These refusals were being verified by CBV officer Zareena. Despite this, AS Basria wrongly accused UCOO Sania of altering data, which was recorded in her handwriting.

During the third day of the NID campaign in January, AS Basria took a one-day leave due to a health issue. However, on the fourth day, she was absent during the morning meeting and asked UCOO Sania to join the meeting but Sania instructed her to go to the field as the meeting had concluded. On the fifth day of the campaign, AS Basria was absent again without approval and failed to submit a medical report. During a sweeping activity, when UCOO Sania called her, she claimed to be on the way to Dahdar, offering excuses without prior leave. After the NID campaign in January, AS Basria requested leave for 10 days for her marriage in Dera Murad Jamali, but her leave was only approved for 7 days. She remained absent for an additional 3 days. In February, on the third day of the campaign, AS Basria requested leave again, citing her father-in-law's serious condition, but it was rejected due to her previous attendance issues. She was absent for 4 days during NID-February without providing medical reports. UCOO Sania verified that she attended an engagement. Additionally, AS Basria has a history of being a latecomer, displaying weak supervision, and providing fake data regarding zero doses. While a new team recorded 60 zero doses in her area, she reported only 8 in the last campaign. When confronted about these issues, AS Basria blamed UCOO Sania and TDOSO Shahid Raza for bias and personal motives. During a visit to AS Basria's area, UCOO Sania witnessed one of her team members, Nazneen, showing the vaccination cover to a child who had died two months prior. When questioned about this, AS Basria argued and questioned UCOO Sania's methods of checking teams. AS Basria objected when

UCOO Sania sent AS Fozia to cover refusals during her absence. UCOO Sania is dissatisfied with AS Baasria's performance and recommends taking action against her and her team, particularly CHW Nazneen, for fake finger marking.

Following is the summary of disciplinary actions that have been taken against AS Basaria.

Sr. #	Disciplinary Actions	Date of Issue	Reason
1	Warning	29-Jan-24	Performance Evaluation Feedback
2	Explanation	26-Feb-24	Tardiness and Late Comer
3	Explanation	08-Mar-24	Absenteeism During Campaign Days
4	Final Warning	05-Apr-24	Performance Evaluation Feedback

4. Conclusion:

Based on our thorough investigation, there is no evidence or statement to substantiate claims of the complainants against the TDOSO Shahid, UCOO Sania. The complainants failed to clearly point out exactly when and what kind of misbehavior they faced at the behest of TDOSO and UCOO. The stance of other Area Supervisors were also taken which shows that the conduct of TDOSO and UCOO is professional and aligned with the SOPs. The other Area Supervisors also denied that the TDOSO and UCOO are personal or biased against the complainant.

The complaint appears to have been filed as a counterblast for the issues reported against them by the UCOO and TDOSO. The instant complaint also finds its root from the issues of unprofessional attitude of Basaria and Zeenat. It has also been transpired that both the complainants are friends and have planned to file the complaint to avoid any disciplinary actions. The complainants were reported by the UCOO and TDOSO previously as well but they did not raised any objections which means that the allegations of biasness and prejudicial attitude does not hold water. Basaria has been continuously reported for her performance-related and attitude issues by her

supervisor. She has also been issued warning and final warning as her last two appraisal falls under the “Unsatisfactory” category. Basaria was again reported for attitude and performance issued on first week of March, 2024 as well which shows that Basaria’s issues are of recurrent nature and despite being served with final warnings, she has not mend her attitude and improve her performance. It is also pertinent to mention here that the complainants (Area Supervisors) have refused to reply to the explanation letter issued to them for poor performance and attitude issues. The failure to respond to the explanation shows that the complainants have no plausible explanation to offer in their defense.

Regarding the allegations against UCSP Israr, the matter was not investigated as he does not falls under the contract of CTC and the investigation team was unable to document his stance on these allegations. However, based on the preponderance of evidence, it appears that these allegations are bereft of merit and meant to distract CTC from taking the corrective measures in line with the issues reported against the complainants.

5. Recommendation:

It is recommended that counseling sessions be conducted in the UCs, emphasizing effective communication. The aim of these sessions is to create a more balanced and effective working environment within the UC. Since AS Basria has already received a final warning, and it is active in her file, therefore if she will be reported again for same in the future her contract will be terminated

Detail of Investigation Committee member CTC:

- Mr.Saqib Mumtaz Manager Legal -HO
- Mr.Ahsan Qazi Project Officer-Disciplinary Matters-Balochistan
- Ms.Hina Project Officer-Disciplinary Matter HO
- Ms.Reema Project Associate-Disciplinary Matter -Balochistan