

Investigation Final Report
On
Workplace Harassment and Unprofessional behavior
Of
Mr. Ibrar Ahmed
UCOO in UC 13-D Quetta-Baluchistan
Inquiry Report by:
Anonymous
CHIP Training & Consulting Pvt. Ltd
Submitted to:
WHO-PO

Contents

1. Background:	3
1.1 Allegations:	3
2. Investigation Process:	3
3. Key findings:	4
4. Finding and Conclusion:	9
5. Recommendations:	10

1. Background:

Complainant: 01 Anonymous CHW,

An anonymous complaint was received via email on September 1st, 2024, expressing severe distress about the working conditions faced by a group of Community Health Workers (CHWs). The complainant highlighted their long-standing commitment to their work over the past eight years, emphasizing the need to provide for their families. However, they reported ongoing harassment from their UCOO Mr. Ibrar Ahmed and UCSP, which has made their work unbearable.

Complainant: 02 Anonymous CHW,

The complainants report significant harassment from their UCOO Mr. Ibrar Ahmed, leading to feelings of frustration and humiliation. They express that the UCOO Mr. Ibrar Ahmed frequently threatens them with job loss and employs severe forms of intimidation. Despite their hard work, they feel unsupported and urgently seek assistance to address these issues.

1.1 Allegation:

The CHW's claim they are pressured to write false letters and confessions admitting to mistakes, regardless of their actual conduct. They described being summoned to the BHU and coerced into accepting blame for issues they did not cause. One alarming instance included a comment suggesting that those who are dying due to illness should wait until after the campaign.

Despite their efforts and dedication to serving the community, they feel their hard work is not recognized, with an assertion that their efforts are seen as self-serving rather than for a higher purpose. The complainant pleads for help in stopping the harassment, as the mental stress has become unbearable, and questions where justice lies for workers enduring such treatment. They request the ability to perform their jobs in peace and seek support to eliminate the pressure and intimidation they face from their supervisors.

2. Investigation Process

The investigation involved collecting testimonies from all involved parties, including:

- **Annex A: Approval Email With WHO-PO Pending**
- **Annex B: Complaint by CHW's Anonymous**
- **Annex C: Defense of the allegations by UCOO Mr. Ibara**
- **Annex D: Statement of TDOSO Mr. Taj**
- **Annex E: Statement of External Monitor**
- **Annex F: Statement of CHW Ms. Palwasha**

- **Annex G: Statement of CHW-Ms. Sadiqa**
- **Annex H: Statement of CHW-Ms. Fazila**
- **Annex I: Statement of CHW-Ms. Alia**
- **Annex J: Statement of CHW-Ms. Nargis**
- **Annex K: Statement of CHW Ms. Nasreen**
- **Annex L: Statement of CHW Ms. Safia**
- **Annex M: Statement of AS Ms. Shahzameen**
- **Annex N: Statement of AS Ms. Zareena**
- **Annex O: Statement of AS Ms. Naila**
- **Annex P: Evidence**

3. Key findings:

The key findings of the Investigation Committee are mentioned as below.

Statement from UCOO Mr. Ibrar,

Mr. Ibrar Ahmed, UCOO, addressed allegations made against him on October 2, 2024, which he claims are entirely false and baseless. The allegations include:

1. Incorrect work methods and harsh behavior.
2. Claims that Area Supervisors (AS) report poor team performance but are instead being reported for issues.
3. Accusations that Mr. Ibrar uses potentially harassing language during meetings, as pointed out in previous training.

Mr. Ibrar emphasized that he faces significant pressure from higher authorities and that he simply conveys their instructions. He argues that if his methods were truly ineffective, the UC would show low performance; however, there have been no failures in LQS or PCM since he has been in his position. He states that issues are reported immediately, and actions are taken according to the UC, leading to dissatisfaction among some teams and Area Supervisors who find his methods inappropriate.

During the April campaign, Mr. Ibrar mentioned that an external monitor was assigned to their UC. Before the monitor's arrival, Ms. Zareena, the Area Supervisor, informed him that the monitor would be evaluating their performance. Mr. Ibrar reassured her that if she worked well, there would be no issues. However, the monitor later pointed out problems with Ms. Zareena, which Mr. Ibrar verified on the ground and found to be completely false, stating that these reports stemmed from personal biases. He informed his staff at the DC office that personal issues were influencing these reports and decided that Ms. Zareena would not be allowed back into the UC.

Additionally, Mr. Ibrar alleged that the same monitor threatened team member Ms. Alia, saying she should resign or she would be fired. He expressed concerns about a previous group within the UC that had formed to blackmail him for their own comfort, which he finds unacceptable. Mr. Ibrar highlighted that his UC is a high-risk area, with positive environmental samples that need to be managed correctly to prevent a significant risk of a polio outbreak.

To further substantiate his claims, Mr. Ibrar invited inquiries by providing the contact details of relevant staff members, including UCSP Ms. Rozina, AS Ms. Zareena Gul, CHW Ms. Naila, CHW Ms. Fazila, CHW Ms. Rukhsana, and CHW Ms. Alia.

Statement from Mr. Taj Muhammad:

During the discussion on October 5, 2024, several points were raised concerning Mr. Ibrar (UCOO) and the team at UC 13D:

1. Team members reported that Mr. Ibrar's behavior towards them is poor, and issues are not being escalated to higher authorities.
2. Ms. Anam, the helper of CHW Ms. Fazeela, was allegedly fired by Mr. Ibrar without cause.
3. External monitor Ms. Gul Zameen had a conflict with UCSP Ms. Rozeena, during which Mr. Ibrar intervened.
4. There is a personal issue between external monitor Ms. Gul Zameen and Area Supervisor Ms. Zareena.
5. An issue concerning Ms. Safia was also mentioned.

Mr. Taj Muhammad, who joined the 13 Series in April 2024, conducted introductory meetings with all staff to discuss the organization's policies. During the April 2024 campaign, Ms. Gul Zameen was assigned as an external monitor, and it was noted that she has personal connections in UC 13D, including her sister, Ms. Shah Zameen. It was reported that Ms. Gul Zameen verbally harassed Ms. Zareena and CHW Ms. Naila due to personal grudges. To address these conflicts, Mr. Taj Muhammad requested Ms. Gul Zameen's replacement for future campaigns.

On the campaign day, Ms. Gul Zameen misbehaved with UCSP Ms. Rozeena in front of staff, prompting Mr. Ibrar to intervene and resolve the situation.

Regarding Mr. Ibrar's behavior, Mr. Taj Muhammad defended him as one of the best-performing UCOOs, strictly adhering to organizational policies and demonstrating commitment. Despite being perceived as strict, he has received no prior complaints about his professionalism.

As for Ms. Safia (CHW), she was marked absent for not attending an appraisal due to her daughter's illness and failed to provide documentation, leading to an investigation where she ultimately apologized for her actions.

In his statement Mr. Taj Muhammad recommends that Ms. Gul Zameen be warned against interfering in program matters to avoid personal conflicts. Additionally, it is suggested that Ms. Shah Zameen be reassigned from UC 13D to Sirki Road, as she is a resident of that area.

Statement from External Monitor Ms. Gulzameen.

Ms. Gulzameen, a training facilitator contracted with CTC, was invited to discuss the investigation concerning UC 13-D due to allegations against UCOO Mr. Ibrar. One allegation against Ms. Gulzameen claims that she only reported AS Ms. Zareena during her monitoring of the SNID campaign, which she categorically denies, stating it is entirely false.

Ms. Gulzameen monitored UC 13-D for five days and reported on all supervisors included in her daily monitoring plan. She visited AS Ms. Shahzameen, AS Mr. Faisal, AS Mr. Farhad, and AS Ms. Zareena, sharing her observations with Mr. Ibrar during morning and evening meetings and via text and voice messages. She noted various performance gaps and issues with team behavior, which she reported to the AS and UC staff and included in her monthly report.

Ms. Gulzameen asserts that she has written evidence of her reports. She observed that AS Ms. Zareena and UCPO Ms. Rozina were unaware of their job responsibilities and when she inquired about documentation, they were unable to provide the necessary information. She reported these findings to Mr. Ibrar, who allegedly dismissed her observations and misbehaved by stating she had no right to question Ms. Rozina. Ms. Gulzameen has reported this behavior to the area coordinator and highlighted the teams' pressure and performance gaps in her reports.

Statements from Other Team Members:

CHW Ms. Palwasha.

Ms. Palwasha, a Community Health Worker (CHW), was called to the CTC office to discuss complaints against UCOO Mr. Ibrar. She acknowledged that Mr. Ibrar's behavior is quite strict, and his tone can often be disrespectful. Ms. Palwasha reported an alarming incident where Mr. Ibrar allegedly told Ms. Safia, "If you want to commit suicide, then do it," which caused her husband to confront Mr. Ibrar at the UC.

Ms. Palwasha also noted that Mr. Ibrar frequently threatens team members, implying he has the power to remove them from their jobs. Additionally, she mentioned that Mr. Ibrar fired a helper, Ms. Anum, allegedly due to a conflict between Anum's sister, AS Ms. Shahzameen, and Mr. Ibrar over door marking.

CHW Ms. Sadiqa

Ms. Sadiqa personally attended the CTC office to address complaints against Mr. Ibrar. She expressed her positive views, stating that UCOO Mr. Ibrar is very good, particularly

in his work. Since his arrival at their UC, he has effectively managed tasks and supported everyone. Ms. Sadiqa noted that there have been no incidents of Mr. Ibrar disrespecting any female staff members.

While she acknowledged that Mr. Ibrar has a temperament issue, she clarified that it is usually related to work or personal matters. She mentioned that he does not tolerate disrespect and stands firm on his decisions, but overall, there has been nothing inappropriate or disrespectful in his behavior.

CHW Ms. Fazila,

Ms. Fazila, a Community Health Worker (CHW), was called to the CTC office to discuss the statements made against UCOO Mr. Ibrar. She strongly believes that these accusations are untrue, stating from her experience that Mr. Ibrar is very good at his work and that she has no issues with him.

Regarding the situation with Ms. Anam, the helper, Ms. Fazila clarified that she personally asked Ms. Anam to leave because her daughter was working with her, and no one had instructed her to remove Ms. Anam from her position. She emphasized that there is no truth to the claim that anyone asked for Ms. Anam's removal.

CHW Ms. Alia,

Ms. Alia, a Community Health Worker (CHW), shared her experience during a recent call to the CTC office concerning complaints against UCOO Mr. Ibrar. She reported that Mr. Ibrar has been misbehaving during training sessions, often threatening the team with job removal. This behavior has affected her and other female colleagues, as they face similar issues.

Ms. Alia expressed concerns about Mr. Ibrar frequently requesting their MC books, fearing he might tamper with their data. Although she considered filing a complaint, she was afraid of potential repercussions. She recounted alarming statements made by Mr. Ibrar, including remarks about suicide and poisoning.

Additionally, Ms. Alia described the difficulties in performing their work effectively due to limitations imposed by their supervisor. She felt pressured to respond to warning letters without consideration for their side of the story and mentioned being denied a shuffle, with Mr. Ibrar asserting control over staff decisions. Even during external monitor visits, she claimed issues in her area were downplayed.

Despite her fears of speaking out, Ms. Alia emphasized her trust in Allah and her hope for integrity among her fellow CHWs in the face of these challenges.

AS Ms. Shahzameen,

Ms. Shahzameen, an Area Supervisor, shared her concerns during a call to the CTC office about complaints against UCOO Mr. Ibrar. She highlighted issues of favoritism in their UC, where favored individuals are not questioned, while others face false reports and mistreatment. During the July campaign, she reported two underperforming teams to Mr. Ibrar but received an explanation letter accusing her of improper supervision, despite her efforts to address the issues.

Ms. Shahzameen stated that Mr. Ibrar turned other Area Supervisors against her and threatened to email allegations of misbehavior, pressuring her to leave the BHU. She described how Mr. Ibrar makes alarming remarks in meetings, implying he controls their livelihoods and discouraging them from speaking out. He reportedly told team members to wait to die until after the campaign and created a toxic work environment through intimidation.

She expressed that many team members want to be shuffled out of the UC due to Mr. Ibrar's harassment, but he refuses these requests. Despite her efforts to communicate her concerns to both Mr. Ibrar and Mr. Taj, her situation has not improved. Ms. Shahzameen pleaded for action against Mr. Ibrar to ensure a peaceful and supportive work environment for all staff.

AS Ms. Zareena,

Ms. Zareena Gul, an Area Supervisor (AS) in UC 13-D, addressed the CTC Officer, expressing her views on UCOO Mr. Ibrar's behavior. She stated that while Mr. Ibrar is strict about work, he treats everyone equally and does not act harshly without reason. She noted that the reporting process in their area has led to discussions and debates, particularly when an Area Supervisor is reported. Ms. Zareena emphasized that the teams reported have valid reasons for their reports, and she appreciates Mr. Ibrar's approach, acknowledging the pressure he faces in his role.

AS Ms. Naila,

Ms. Naila Gul, an Area Supervisor (AS), addressed concerns about UCOO Mr. Ibrar's behavior, stating that he is cooperative and supportive, contrary to claims of harshness. She clarified the situation regarding Ms. Anum, explaining that Anum was not a Community Health Worker (CHW) but a helper whose inappropriate behavior, including taking and sending a photo of her supervisor, led to her termination. Ms. Naila noted that Mr. Ibrar has not exhibited any harsh behavior during meetings or training sessions and requested kindness in addressing this matter.

CHW Ms. Nargis,

In her statement, Ms. Nargis Nadeem, a Community Health Worker (CHW) in UC 13-D, addressed complaints against UCOO Mr. Ibrar. She stated that, since he took on the

role, she has never experienced any misbehavior from him and has not heard negative comments about him from her team. Ms. Nargis described Mr. Ibrar as a good person who performs his duties with honesty and is strict regarding work performance. She emphasized that any complaints against him may stem from personal perspectives, as she has never had any reason to complain about his behavior. She concluded by affirming her belief in his character.

CHW Ms. Nasreen,

Ms. Nasreen, Code 1176 from UC 13-D, was called to the CTC office concerning matters related to UCOO Mr. Ibrar. In her statement, she expressed that Mr. Ibrar strictly focuses on work-related discussions and has never made any inappropriate comments.

CHW Ms. Safia,

Ms. Safia, a Community Health Worker (CHW), shared her account of an incident involving UCOO Mr. Ibrar. She stated that after commenting to Madam UC Lead about drinking cold water in cold weather, she was called to the Basic Health Unit (BHU) and accused of misbehavior. Despite apologizing multiple times, she felt publicly scolded in front of the Area Supervisors (AS) and was not allowed to leave after work.

On another occasion, Ms. Safia was summoned to the BHU while at a kidney hospital. When she explained her situation, she was asked to provide proof, which she did, but was still pressured to attend the meeting. She recounted expressing her frustration by saying, "You are forcing people to drink poison." This comment was used against her, leading to accusations of making threats. She mentioned that the incident was repeatedly referenced during training sessions, with UCOO Mr. Ibrar and Sir Taj discussing it in a manner that left her feeling harassed. Ms. Safia requested assistance in addressing the ongoing issues she faces.

4. Conclusion:

The investigation committee outcomes reveal a significant divide in perceptions of UCOO Mr. Ibrar's behavior among the staff at UC 13-D. Some team members, including Ms. Sadiqa, Ms. Fazila, AS Ms. Zareena, AS Ms. Naila, Ms. Nargis, and Ms. Nasreen, described Mr. Ibrar as professional and supportive. In contrast, others, such as Ms. Palwasha, Ms. Alia, AS Mr. Shahzameen, and Ms. Safia, reported experiencing harsh and disrespectful behavior. Serious allegations include threats of job termination and inappropriate comments, including telling a team member to commit suicide, causing psychological distress among staff.

External Monitor Ms. Gulzameen, sister of AS Mr. Shahzameen, alleged that Mr. Ibrar dismissed her observations and misbehaved during her monitoring visit. She raised concerns about AS Ms. Zareena and UCPO Ms. Rozina, claiming Mr. Ibrar ignored her

reports on their performance. Personal grudges among Ms. Gulzameen, Mr. Shahzameen, and Mr. Ibrar have contributed to a toxic environment in UC 13-D.

Mr. Taj Muhammad defended Mr. Ibrar, asserting that he is one of the best-performing UCOOs who adheres to organizational policies. He argued that complaints arise from personal biases rather than professional shortcomings. The termination of helper Ms. Anum sparked controversy, with conflicting opinions on its justification based on performance.

Several team members, particularly Ms. Alia and AS Mr. Shahzameen, reported feeling pressured and threatened, accusing Mr. Ibrar of intimidation. Despite formal complaints, staff feel their concerns have not been addressed, indicating unresolved conflicts and a lack of professionalism that hinder the effectiveness of UC 13-D.

In conclusion, the investigation committee found that there are differing opinions among staff about Mr. Ibrar's behavior. Some team members view him as professional and dedicated, while others report feeling disrespected and threatened, leading to a stressful work environment. The personal conflicts between Mr. Ibrar, Ms. Gulzameen, AS Shahzameen, and AS Zareena have made the situation worse, creating tension in UC 13-D.

5. Recommendations:

In light of the investigation committee's findings, the committee recommends:

- Verbal warnings should be given to Mr. Taj Muhammad, Ms. Gulzameen, and AS Ms. Shahzameen and she should be shuffled to UC Sirki.
- Mr. Ibrar should be reassigned to a different UC, issued a Warning Letter, and placed on a one-month probationary contract as per the Polio Third Party Personnel Service Rules (PTPPSR), Annex – 7-B: Disciplinary Action in Case of Performance/Capacity Issues - Amber line Areas: Sub Clause 4: “ **Unprofessional or Casual Behavior towards peers/colleagues and Poor supportive supervision**”.
- To resolve the personal conflicts exacerbating the situation, counseling sessions should be arranged for all UC Staff. The goal is to help everyone feel respected and valued in their roles. By focusing on creating a positive work environment, we can improve the overall atmosphere and help staff work better together in UC 13-D.