

Final Investigation Report

On

Unprofessional Attitude

By

Mr. Muhammad Saleem

(UCPO UC 13-E Quetta-Baluchistan)

Inquiry Report by:

CHIP Training & Consulting Pvt. Ltd

Submitted to:

WHO-PO

Contents

1. Background:.....3

1.1 Allegations3

2. Methodology.....4

3. Key findings4

4. Conclusion:8

5. Recommendations9

1. Background:

Ms. Saeeda Bibi, Area Supervisor for UC 13-E, has filed a formal complaint against UCPO Mr. Muhammad Saleem, alleging unfair treatment and harassment. She claims that despite her satisfactory work, Mr. Muhammad Saleem consistently accuses her of poor performance, issues explanation notices, and threatens to report her. She recounts being unfairly penalized for minor lateness and transferred to another area without consideration for her circumstances.

Ms. Saeeda also highlights that Mr. Muhammad Saleem disregards her and other supervisors' concerns, such as requests to adjust meeting times based on team availability and he frequently issues warnings for delays caused by slow team performance. Despite her attempts to explain these challenges, Mr. Muhammad Saleem continues to report her and issues notices for incomplete paperwork. She feels that Mr. Muhammad Saleem has a personal bias against her and creates a stressful work environment by demanding reports for every task while providing no support or guidance.

Additionally, Ms. Saeeda claims that Mr. Muhammad Saleem, with the support of TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad prevents supervisors from raising concerns with higher authorities. This has created a climate of fear, negatively affecting her ability to perform her duties.

1.1 Allegation.

- **Allegations Against UCPO Mr. Muhammad Saleem:**

Ms. Saeeda Bibi accuses UCPO Mr. Muhammad Saleem of consistently creating a hostile work environment. She claims that despite her satisfactory performance, Mr. Muhammad Saleem repeatedly accuses her of poor work and issues unjust warnings and explanation notices, exaggerating minor infractions such as being late for five minutes. He ignores her health issues and transferred her to another area without her valid reasons into consideration. Additionally, Mr. Muhammad Saleem disregards her concerns about her team's slow pace and refuses to adjust meeting time to accommodate their schedules. Ms. Saeeda feels that he holds a personal bias against her, requiring her to report every task but offering no guidance or support. Furthermore, he does not regularly attend meetings or maintain proper records but continues to criticize the supervisors for their performance, adding unnecessary pressure to her duties.

- **Concerns Regarding TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad :**

Ms. Saeeda also alleges that TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad has failed to provide support and has contributed to the hostile work environment. When she reached out for assistance, Mr. Taj Muhammad was unresponsive, refusing to help and abruptly ending the conversation during a critical time. Additionally, along with Mr. Muhammad Saleem, he allegedly prevented supervisors from raising their concerns

with IO Dr. Nadir Shah. Ms. Saeeda claims that Mr. Taj Muhammad lack of support and refusal to address these issues has intensified the stressful atmosphere, leaving supervisors in constant fear of reprimand.

2. Methodology:

Following the directives received, CTC conducted a comprehensive investigation focused on interviewing AS Ms. Saeeda Bibi, UCPO Mr. Muhammad Saleem, UCOO Mr. Muhammad Zahid, AS Mr. Fareed Ahmed, AS Ms. Mehtab Gul, AS Ms. Samreen, AS Mr. Zahoor and TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad to gather evidence regarding the allegations.

- Annex A: WHO-PO Approval for investigation.
- Annex B: Complaint by Area Supervisor Ms. Saeeda Bibi
- Annex C: Defense of the allegations by UCPO Mr. Muhammad Saleem
- Annex D: Statement of UCOO Mr. Muhammad Zahid
- Annex E: Statement of Area Supervisor Mr. Fareed Ahmed
- Annex F: Statement of Area Supervisor Ms. Mehtab Gul
- Annex G: Statement of Area Supervisor Ms. Samreen
- Annex H: Statement of Area Supervisor Mr. Zahoor
- Annex I: Evidence Picture Provided by Ms. Saeeda
- Annex j: Statement of TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad.

3. Key findings:

The key findings of the Investigation Committee are mentioned as below.

- **Statement UCPO Mr. Mr. Muhammad Saleem**

Mr. Muhammad Saleem, the UCPO for 13E, transferred from UC 13C in April 2024, addresses objections raised by UCDO and area supervisors regarding his performance. The main points of criticism include his lack of note-taking during training sessions, unnecessary training calls, harsh language during meetings, direct communication with CHWs instead of going through area supervisors, inappropriate behavior, making excessive reports about minor issues, instilling fear among staff, and causing unnecessary disruptions.

Mr. Saleem refutes these allegations, asserting they are false and baseless. He believes that since his arrival, UC 13E has improved significantly, noting that before his tenure, the unit failed 7 out of 8 LQAS assessments. He highlights discrepancies in CHW data and documentation that he has addressed with Mr. Taj Muhammad and Dr. Nadir. Mr. Muhammad Saleem requests that all supervisors be called to provide a comprehensive view of his performance, suggesting that the accusations stem from those not fulfilling their responsibilities.

- **Statement of UCOO Mr. Muhammad Zahid**

Mr. Muhammad Zahid, UCOO 13E, addressed a complaint against UCPO Mr. Saleem, citing problematic behavior. He reports that Mr. Saleem insists on complete agreement from the staff and reacts negatively if anyone disagrees, often escalating issues to TDO Mr. Taj Muhammad. Mr. Zahid feels sidelined in UC matters, as his input is not considered, and decisions are heavily influenced by Mr. Saleem. He also described an incident on September 28th, 2024, where he was insulted by the TDO in front of the staff, adding to his mental stress. Mr. Zahid expressed concerns that CBO and CM fully support Mr. Saleem, further marginalizing him.

- **Statement of AS Mr. Fareed Ahmed**

Mr. Fareed Ahmed, Area Supervisor UC 13E, confirmed the validity of the complaint made at the CTC office, citing multiple issues he has personally faced. He mentioned being falsely accused by Community Mobilizer Mr. Atta Ullah of being affiliated with a banned organization, which was done publicly in front of the staff, including IO Dr. Nadir and TDO Mr. Taj, with no action taken. Mr. Saleem has repeatedly pressured him to leave the program and has exhibited inappropriate behavior towards the entire staff. Additionally, Mr. Taj has referred to Mr. Ahmed as "Sarmachar" in front of others, causing mental stress. Mr. Saleem has also attended BHU meetings without prior notice and humiliated staff. Mr. Atta Ullah, supported by communication staff and the CBO in the G3 area, has continued to accuse Mr. Ahmed after he stopped providing transportation services, despite the unresolved issue of his motorcycle for two years.

- **Statement of AS Ms. Mehtab Gul**

Ms. Mehtab Gul, Area Supervisor UC 13E, describes the difficult working conditions under UCPO Mr. Saleem, citing mental distress, fear, and lack of communication. She reports that Mr. Saleem uses harsh language, ignores team concerns, and calls meetings at inappropriate times, including at his home where male members have made inappropriate remarks. Despite reporting issues, no actions were taken by supervisors like CBO Mr. Farooq or UCPO Mr. Saleem. Ms. Gul also shared an incident where she was assaulted during a campaign, but despite reporting it, little support was provided, leading to her fear of working in certain areas. She also feels disrespected and exhausted, with supervisors disregarding her input and making it difficult for her to perform her job safely.

- **Statement of AS Ms. Samreen**

Ms. Samreen, Area Supervisor, confirms that the issues reported about UCPO Mr. Saleem are true. She states that Mr. Saleem offers no support and expresses frustration with his assignment to UC 13E, which he takes out on the staff. Meetings are scheduled at 7:30 AM, an unusual practice. Ms. Samreen recounts an incident where TDO Mr. Taj publicly humiliated the UC 13E staff by making them stand outside for 25 minutes as "punishment" for unsatisfactory work, leading to Area Supervisor Ms. Zareena's resignation. Complaints raised by staff often result in further reporting against them, with little action taken to resolve their concerns.

- **Statement of As Mr. Zahoor**

Since Mr. Saleem's arrival in 13E, the situation has worsened. Mr. Taj told Mr. Zahid to treat Mr. Saleem's word as unquestionable, leading to warnings based solely on Mr. Saleem's input. Mr. Saleem has suggested separating long-standing couple teams, which has already caused Ms. Zareena to resign, and other Area Supervisors may follow if Mr. Saleem and Mr. Farooq's behavior continues. The conflict between Mr. Saleem and Mr. Zahid is causing issues for the staff, and either Mr. Saleem or Mr. Zahid should be reassigned to restore balance. Despite Mr. Saleem, Mr. Farooq, and Mr. Attaullah not having motorcycles, they are still expected to manage refusal cases. Mr. Zahid is being disregarded, and the zone runs according to Mr. Saleem's directives. Mr. Taj should consult with Area Supervisors before issuing warnings based solely on Mr. Saleem's input.

- **Statement of TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad**

The investigation into UC 13-E includes several allegations made by Area Supervisors against UCPO Mr. Saleem. Mr. Saleem was transferred to UC 13-E in April 2024 due to weak supervision and programmatic issues in the area. Since his arrival, he has identified gaps, reported problems, and recommended actions, resulting in disciplinary measures. Some supervisors, including Ms. Zareena and Ms. Mehtab Gul, saw these actions as personal and began blaming Mr. Saleem. Additionally, a conflict involving Ms. Mehtab being beaten at a refusal household was addressed by local authorities, and a resolution was reached with her family's involvement. However, Ms. Mehtab continues to cause issues, and her supervision has been reported as weak. Allegations against Mr. Saleem are seen as reactions to the warnings and explanations he issued. The recommendation is for Ms. Mehtab to provide an explanation for the allegations.

I would like to express my opinion regarding the investigation of UC 13-E in which Area supervisor has raised few allegations on UCPO Mr. Saleem are baseless.

4. Conclusion:

In conclusion, the investigation highlights serious problems in UC 13-E, particularly concerning the behavior of UCPO Mr. Muhammad Saleem. Many staff members, including Ms. Saeeda Bibi, describe him as creating a difficult and stressful work environment. Mr. Saleem is accused of unfairly issuing warnings, exaggerating small mistakes, and being unsympathetic to the challenges his team faces. Supervisors like Mr. Zahid and Mr. Fareed Ahmed support Ms. Saeeda's claims, noting that Mr. Saleem's strict behavior and constant reporting have instilled fear and stress among the staff. He is also criticized for not listening to concerns about slow team performance and scheduling meetings at inconvenient times.

Additionally, TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad is criticized for failing to assist the staff and for supporting Mr. Saleem's actions by ignoring complaints and publicly embarrassing staff members. Supervisors report that Mr. Taj dismisses their concerns and prevents them from raising issues with higher officials, contributing to a tense work environment. Some supervisors have even considered quitting due to the emotional stress and difficulties they face.

While TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad asserts that Mr. Saleem's disciplinary actions align with policy, it is clear that his management style has led to a challenging work environment. Numerous staff members, including Ms. Saeeda Bibi, Mr. Zahid, and Mr. Fareed Ahmed, report that Mr. Saleem's approach has fostered an atmosphere of fear and stress, characterized by unfair warnings and a lack of support for the team's difficulties.

Furthermore, the claims made by Ms. Mehtab Gul regarding her treatment and the refusal household incident, though contested, illustrate the tension and conflict among staff. It appears that these interpersonal issues may have arisen in response to the strict oversight and management tactics employed by Mr. Saleem.

The investigation team acknowledges the complexity of the situation and recommends a review of the management practices within UC 13-E. It is crucial to foster a more supportive work environment where staff feel heard and valued. Additionally, we suggest that further training and conflict resolution strategies be implemented to address the existing tensions and improve team dynamics.

Overall, while some allegations may stem from personal grievances, the broader issues of staff morale and management practices must be addressed to ensure the effective functioning of UC 13-E.

5. Recommendations:

UCPO Mr. Muhammad Saleem: His behavior is deemed inappropriate, and it is recommended that he shall receive a warning letter along with a counseling session to improve his conduct as per the Polio Third Party Personnel Service Rules (PTPPSR), Annex – 7-B: Disciplinary Action in Case of Performance/ Disciplinary/ Accountability Framework/ Capacity Issues - Amber line Areas/ Sub Clause: 4/ Unprofessional or Casual Behavior towards peers/ colleagues.

TDOSO Mr. Taj Muhammad: He does not listen to staff concerns, fails to provide support, and publicly humiliates staff. It is recommended that he also shall receive a warning letter along with counseling session to address these issues as per the Polio Third Party Personnel Service Rules (PTPPSR), Annex – 7-B: Disciplinary Action in Case of Performance/ Disciplinary/ Accountability Framework/ Capacity Issues - Amber line Areas/ Sub Clause: 4/ Poor supportive supervision.

UCOO Mr. Zahid: He is not performing his duties effectively in UC 13-E and is not taking his work seriously. The recommendation is for him to shall receive a warning letter along with counseling session, and be transferred out of UC 13-E as per the Polio Third Party Personnel Service Rules (PTPPSR), Annex – 7-B: Disciplinary Action in Case of Performance/ Disciplinary/ Accountability Framework/ Capacity Issues - Amber line Areas/ Sub Clause: 6/ Poor Performance compliance with position TOR.