

Investigation Final Report

On

Unprofessional Behavior and Misuse of Authority

Mr. Nizamuddin Uddin UCOO

Ward- 8 Quetta-Baluchistan

Inquiry Report by:

CHIP Training & Consulting Pvt. Ltd.

Submitted to:

WHO-PO.

Contents

1. Background:	3
1.1 Allegations	3
2. Investigation Process	4
3. Key Findings	5
4. Conclusion	10
5. Recommendations	10

1. Background:

CHW Ms. Rabia and AS Ms. Shabana have filed a formal complaint against UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin, alleging persistent unprofessional behavior and getting personal towards them. The complaint details multiple incidents involving Mr. Nizamuddin's actions towards Ms. Rabia and CHW Ms. Rehana, raised concerns about the involvement of AS Ms. Bilquees, AS Ms. Haseena, and other team members.

1.1 Allegations

Allegations by Ms. Rabia:

- 1. Forceful Instruction to Write Apology Letter:** Ms. Rabia alleges that UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin summoned CHW Ms. Rehana to the BHU and pressured her into writing an apology letter, claiming that she would admit to faults she did not commit.
- 2. Harassment and Personal Attacks:** Ms. Rabia reports that on the day of contract distribution, Mr. Nizamuddin questioned whether she had lodged a complaint against him with CTC, implying that it would only cause her distress and would not affect him personally. He also allegedly made derogatory remarks about her mental state, claiming she was "too attached to her husband and in-laws."
- 3. Fabricated Issues with Ms. Rehana's Area:** Initially, no issues were raised about Ms. Rehana's work in the Micro Census. However, over time, Mr. Nizamuddin reportedly began creating problems with her assigned area, which Ms. Rabia claims did not exist.
- 4. Apology Letter Incident at BHU:** Ms. Rabia claims that Ms. Rehana was called to the BHU, where, in the presence of AS Ms. Bilquees and AS Ms. Haseena, she was separated from the group and coerced into writing an apology letter under Mr. Nizamuddin's instruction.
- 5. Threats of Termination and Unwarranted Criticism:** Mr. Nizamuddin is alleged to have repeatedly reported Ms. Rabia for minor issues, including a previous mistake she had already apologized for. He is further accused of threatening her with termination and stating that he would no longer report her mistakes but would instead support Ms. Rehana.
- 6. Change in Ms. Rehana's Behavior:** Following Mr. Nizamuddin's intervention, Ms. Rabia observes a significant change in Ms. Rehana's behavior, with Rehana allegedly stating that "this girl screws my mind," a comment reportedly influenced by Mr. Nizamuddin. Ms. Rabia further claims that Mr. Nizamuddin instructed Ms. Rehana to report her for termination.
- 7. False Accusations by CHW Sadia:** Ms. Rabia also mentions that CHW Sadia falsely accused her of causing disturbances in her family. Ms. Rabia asserts that she only visited Sadia's house with another colleague, dismissing the accusation as baseless.

Allegations by Ms. Shabana:

1. **Repeated Harassment and Insults:** Ms. Shabana alleges that UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin visited her area multiple times during the campaign, where he accused her of theft, insulted her in front of her colleagues, and made critical remarks about her behavior. He reportedly mocked her appearance, comparing her to the UC lead and questioning her professionalism.
2. **Unwarranted Allegations of Misconduct:** Ms. Shabana recounts an incident in which Mr. Nizamuddin allegedly spread false rumors about her, including fabricated stories about her behavior at a refusal house and her supposed trip to Jinnah Town. He reportedly claimed that her team members had informed him about these actions, even though Ms. Shabana denies any such behavior.
3. **Derogatory Remarks on Personal Life and Appearance:** Mr. Nizamuddin allegedly made inappropriate and personal comments about Ms. Shabana's appearance, stating that she did not dress modestly and that he was "ashamed to look at her." When confronted by her cousin, Mr. Nizamuddin denied these comments but did not offer a satisfactory explanation.
4. **Interference with Complaints:** Ms. Shabana states that whenever she attempted to report issues with her team, Mr. Nizamuddin discouraged her from making formal complaints, opting instead to give verbal warnings to the concerned individuals. He also reportedly mocked her family situation, particularly when her mother fell ill and she needed to take time off to visit the hospital.
5. **Threats and Inappropriate Behavior:** Ms. Shabana alleges that Mr. Nizamuddin acted unprofessionally, including sending multiple voice notes insisting on the submission of reports while she was dealing with her mother's illness. Furthermore, he reportedly dismissed her concerns as insignificant and continued to display unprofessional conduct.

2. Investigation Process

The investigation involved collecting testimonies from all involved parties, including:

- **Annex A:** Complaint by CHW Ms. Rabia and AS Ms. Shabana
- **Annex B:** Defense of the Allegations by UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin
- **Annex C:** Statement of UCOO Ms. Sadaf
- **Annex-D:** Statement of AS Ms. Saeeda
- **Annex E:** Statement of AS Maria
- **Annex F:** Statement of CHW Ms. Irum
- **Annex G:** Statement of CHW Ms. Rehana
- **Annex H:** Statement of CHW Ms. Sadia
- **Annex I:** Statement of AS Ms. Bilqees
- **Annex J:** Statement of CHW Ms. Asia
- **Annex K:** Statement of AS Haseena

- **Annex L:** Statement of CHW Asia
- **Annex M:** Statement of TF Razia
- **Annex N:** Evidence

3. Key findings:

Defense of the Allegations by UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin

Mr. Nizamuddin, UCOO, was questioned regarding his Area Supervisor (AS), Ms. Shabana. Mr. Nizamuddin acknowledged that he had previously submitted a complaint email against Ms. Shabana following grievances reported by her four Community Health Workers (CHWs). He also expressed concerns about Ms. Shabana's conduct, which he believed could potentially cause issues for the program in the future. During the inquiry, UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin was asked to complete a form outlining allegations against him, including claims of inappropriate behavior during a phone call. He denied any intentional misconduct but expressed regret if any unintentional offense had occurred. Additionally, on another allegation involving CHW Rabia. UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin explained that he had assigned two AS, Ms. Humaira and Ms. Saeeda, to investigate an incident at CHW Sadia's residence. Their findings confirmed that CHW Rabia had interfered in Sadia's personal matters, and this information was reported back to him. In response to allegations that he was biased against CHW Rabia, Mr. Nizamuddin denied the claims, asserting that his interactions with her were strictly professional and limited to work-related matters. He also shared additional concerns regarding Ms. Rabia's behavior. Mr. Nizamuddin concluded by emphasizing his professionalism and dedication to his role, noting his six months of service as UCOO. He invited verification of his conduct from colleagues, including a former TF who worked in the same location during his tenure.

Statement of Former UCOO Ms. Sadaf

UCOO Ms. Sadaf is currently working in UC Ward 59. Previously, she served as the UCOO for Ward 8. During a discussion, she provided a briefing about all the issues related to UC Ward 8. She clarified that she did not have any personal relationship with any of the AS in Ward 8. UCOO Ms. Sadaf shared all the information she had regarding AS Ms. Shabana. According to Ms. Sadaf, AS Shabana's team of CHWs never reported any issues about their AS to her. She stated that she was unaware of any incidents involving inappropriate behavior with the CHWs. Ms. Sadaf further mentioned that AS Ms. Shabana once disclosed that Mr. Arman is her cousin and that the environment at her house was disreputable and unpleasant. AS Ms. Shabana had also informed Ms. Sadaf that the police had once arrested her cousin, although she did not know the actual reason behind it. During Ms. Sadaf's tenure as the UCOO for Ward 8, AS Ms. Shabana used to call her CHWs to the Kit station. If she needed to call them to her home, she always sought prior permission from Ms. Sadaf.

Statement of AS Ms. Saeeda.

AS Ms. Saeeda stated that AS Ms. Humaira was very good at her work and knowledgeable in her field, while UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin was described as a kind and professional individual who never contact any staff member unnecessarily. Regarding CHW Ms. Rabia, she mentioned that she found her to be competent and diligent in her duties. Concerning AS Ms. Shabana, it was reported that she often teased her CHWs even after their work was completed. Lastly, regarding CHW Ms. Rehana, she clarified that their interaction was limited to exchanging greetings.

Statement of AS Ms. Maria.

AS Ms. Maria reported that AS Ms. Shabana and CHW Ms. Rabia exhibit irresponsible behavior. She stated that CHW Ms. Rabia often teases her AS about work and is frequently absent from the field, showing a lack of commitment. AS Ms. Shabana reportedly treats her team poorly, has shared their contact numbers with her boyfriend, and encourages inappropriate behavior. If team members refuse to comply, she teases them about their work and reports them, creating a negative atmosphere in the UC. However, AS Ms. Maria noted that she has observed nothing inappropriate or suspicious about UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin, describing him as professional, strict about work, and instrumental in maintaining a positive working environment in the UC.

Statement of Ms. Irum.

The following statement was provided by Ms. Irum, a former team member of AS Ms. Shabana, as part of the investigation. Ms. Irum stated that she had contacted the CTC office regarding the case of UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin and AS Ms. Shabana. She described UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin as professional and effective in his role, highlighting that since his joining, the UC's work had improved significantly, and operations were running smoothly. However, Ms. Irum reported several issues with her former supervisor, AS Ms. Shabana. She alleged that AS Ms. Shabana often teased team members without reason and brought her boyfriend to the kit station. Ms. Irum also claimed that AS Ms. Shabana manipulated the team's MC book data and lacked appropriate dressing sense, which caused discomfort in the community. Additionally, AS Ms. Shabana was reported to have traveled on a bike with CHW Ms. Asia's husband and misused Ms. Irum's quiet nature by burdening her with the entire team's workload. Ms. Irum recounted a specific incident where AS Ms. Shabana instructed her to accompany one of her acquaintances to a hospital while asking other CHWs to wait for her until 6:00 PM. She further alleged that AS Ms. Shabana leaked her phone number and CHW Ms. Rehana's number, leading to frequent calls and messages from unknown individuals. This situation caused personal distress, as Ms. Irum's brother questioned her about receiving messages from strangers. Ms. Irum also stated that AS Ms. Shabana often asked CHW Ms. Asia to bring food for her and demanded money from team members for this purpose. She reportedly vented her personal frustrations on the team, creating a negative working environment.

Ms. Irum emphasized the need for confidentiality, stating that she continues to work in this role out of necessity.

Statement of Ms. Rehana.

AS Ms. Shabana brought her boyfriend to the kit station, leading to complaints from the watchman, who mentioned that the doctor was angry about the situation. It was also alleged that Ms. Shabana reported any mistakes made by the complainant directly to her family members. Additionally, Ms. Shabana spread negative rumors about the team in the community and once physically pushed the complainant in front of a refusal house, taunting her by saying she had saved the complainant's sister's job. The complainant further stated that Ms. Shabana involved the Community Mobilizer in decisions that were the complainant's responsibility. She also pressured team members to visit her house for data-related matters and demanded money, during which her sister and mother would taunt the team by claiming that Ms. Shabana did all the work while the others merely collected salaries. Leave requests sent to Ms. Shabana were reportedly not forwarded for approval but directly denied. Ms. Shabana frequently left the team alone in the field and instructed them to cover for her absence by saying she had just left. On voting day, she distributed the team members' contact numbers to boys working in the area, leading to personal problems for the complainant at home. Ms. Shabana also falsely claimed that other team members, including the Community Mobilizer, were backbiting about the complainant, creating unnecessary tensions. The complainant noted that Ms. Shabana often involved her in family matters, especially when her cousins or sisters working in the same UC were mentioned. Despite the complainant requesting that these matters not be shared, Ms. Shabana continued to bring them up and subsequently started teasing her. In recent days, Ms. Shabana had given the complainant's phone number to others, causing significant frustration. Lastly, the complainant mentioned that Ms. Shabana frequently visited her house and stated that she was working out of compulsion. These actions have created an un-peaceful and distressing work environment for the complainant, who expressed a strong desire to avoid further interaction with Ms. Shabana.

Statement of Ms. Sadia.

The following statement was provided by CHW Ms. Sadia (Code 293) regarding the cases involving UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin, AS Ms. Shabana, and CHWs Ms. Rabia and Ms. Rehana. CHW Ms. Sadia stated that UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin is strict when it comes to work but communicates politely with the community and does not create difficulties for the team. His approach to work is firm but professional. Ms. Sadia reported filing a case against CHWs Ms. Rabia and Ms. Rehana. She alleged that, despite barely knowing them, both individuals spread false and defamatory rumors about her. They reportedly visited her house and informed her sister-in-law that she was divorced and had run away from home. This false information was also shared with other team members, including Ms. Saeeda. After learning about these actions, Ms. Sadia reported the matter

to her UCOO. Regarding AS Ms. Shabana, Ms. Sadia noted that before her recent shuffle, Ms. Shabana frequently teased her team and manipulated their workbooks, causing issues. Community members expressed displeasure with AS Ms. Shabana, stating that they would not allow their children to receive polio vaccines if she was involved and even refused to let Ms. Sadia enter their homes. Ms. Sadia further stated that AS Ms. Shabana is often seen with a man in his car who frequently visits her field area. On 19th November 2024, Ms. Sadia observed Ms. Shabana in this individual's car on Shabaz Street while working in her area. This statement highlights Ms. Sadia's concerns regarding the conduct of the individuals mentioned and the impact on her work and community interactions.

Statement of Ms. Bilqees.

The following statement was provided by AS Ms. Bilqees (Code 2072) regarding various issues in UC Ward-8 involving CHWs Ms. Rabia, Ms. Sadia, Ms. Rehana, and AS Ms. Shabana: AS Ms. Bilqees reported being called to the CTC office regarding CHW Ms. Rabia's performance. She stated that Ms. Rabia works in an unorganized manner, skipping houses in her area. During an inspection, AS Ms. Bilqees found that Ms. Rabia had not visited 8 to 10 houses. Upon contacting her, Ms. Rabia explained that she had been working on another street because it was easier for her and intended to cover the skipped houses later. AS Ms. Bilqees instructed Ms. Rabia to resume work from where she had left off but later received a confirmation call from UCOO. She did not formally report Ms. Rabia to UCOO Ms. Sadaf, hoping for improvement. However, Ms. Rabia continues to neglect her responsibilities and argues when confronted. Ms. Bilqees also highlighted an issue involving CHW Ms. Sadia, who has been spreading gossip about AS Ms. Hassina in the community. According to Ms. Bilqees, Ms. Sadia's sister-in-law reported that Ms. Sadia was spreading false rumors, leading to discussions about the team within the community. When AS Ms. Humaira and Ms. Bilqees visited Ms. Sadia's house, both Ms. Sadia and her sister-in-law confirmed the allegations against CHW Ms. Rabia, attributing the rumors to her. Ms. Rabia, however, claimed she had only asked questions out of sympathy. Ms. Bilqees advised Ms. Rabia to focus on her work and refrain from interfering in others' personal matters. Regarding CHW Ms. Rehana, Ms. Bilqees stated that she has a positive attitude and is diligent in her work, although she struggles with writing. No complaints have been raised against Ms. Rehana. Ms. Bilqees also mentioned her sister, AS Ms. Shabana, whom she supervises. Initially, Ms. Shabana interfered in Ms. Bilqees's workspace, but this ceased after the matter was reported to former UCOO Ms. Sadaf. Ms. Bilqees noted that Ms. Shabana's personal matters are her own concern and clarified that her dressing is appropriate, as she wears a Shawl. Finally, Ms. Bilqees remarked that UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin is cooperative and supportive of the team. While he can be strict about work-related issues, he ensures that his feedback is constructive and fosters understanding among team members.

Statement of Ms. Asia.

The following statement was provided by CHW Ms. Asia Panezai (Code 311) regarding her experiences while working under AS Ms. Shabana in Ward-8: Ms. Asia Panezai reported that AS Ms. Shabana frequently asked her to request her husband to drop Ms. Shabana at the BHU whenever she was late in submitting data. Additionally, Ms. Shabana instructed team members to collect money to buy food from outside. MS. Asia also mentioned that visiting Ms. Shabana's house was uncomfortable due to an unpleasant environment and inappropriate behavior displayed in front of the team. Regarding UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin, Ms. Asia stated that he is highly professional and good at his work. She recalled an instance at the BHU when Mr. Nizamuddin inquired about the team's experiences with their AS and her behavior toward them. Furthermore, Ms. Asia shared that AS Ms. Shabana often asked her to bring food, refreshment items. On her way to the kit station but never reimbursed her for these expenses.

Statement of Ms. Haseena

Ms. Haseena reported that UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin is highly efficient and strict about work, which has led to improved team performance. She noted that under the previous UCOO, Ms. Sadaf, the CHWs were less responsive and less disciplined. Regarding AS Ms. Shabana, Ms. Haseena mentioned that during one training session, CHWs openly complained about Ms. Shabana to TF Ms. Razia Shah in the presence of other CHWs and AS. Following the session, a discussion about the issue was held with UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin and TF Ms. Razia Shah. Ms. Haseena also stated that she and her team had never traveled in a car with Ms. Shabana. However, they frequently observed a man, whom Ms. Shabana referred to as her cousin, attending four-pack meetings. Additionally, Ms. Haseena recounted an incident where AS Ms. Bilqis's CHW, Ms. Sadia, inquired if Ms. Sadia was divorced. Ms. Haseena clarified that she avoids discussing personal matters, as she is focused solely on work. She also mentioned that UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin subsequently sent AS Ms. Bilqis and AS Ms. Humaira to investigate the matter at CHW Ms. Sadia's house. Lastly, Ms. Haseena noted that while AS Ms. Shabana is active across all zones, she has not been responsive to UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin's directives.

Statement of Ms. Aneesa

The staff member reported a series of issues concerning AS Ms. Shabana. They mentioned that AS Ms. Shabana manipulates the data by removing children's status from the staff member's MC Book. The staff member also complained about AS Ms. Shabana's behavior, saying she misbehaves in front of the community and reports even minor mistakes to the staff member's mother. Additionally, AS Ms. Shabana frequently calls the staff member to her house, but the environment is described as unpleasant, and the staff member expressed discomfort in visiting.

The staff member also mentioned that AS Ms. Shabana has shared their personal matters within the UC and has frequently expressed distrust in the staff member's work. Furthermore, AS Ms. Shabana has asked AS Ms. Saira to interfere in the staff member's area and invited her companion to the kit station. She then went for drives with this companion, which the community disapproved of. The staff member also reported that AS Ms. Shabana asks for the community's phone numbers.

The staff member is frustrated with AS Ms. Shabana's actions, stating they are often left alone in their area while AS Ms. Shabana visits other teams. When AS Ms. Shabana is in a bad mood, she refuses to respond to questions, deceives the teams, and creates conflicts among them. As a result, the staff member decided to file a formal complaint.

Statement of TF Ms. Razia

I received a call from the CTC office in which I was asked about a complaint against AS Shabana. I was asked whether AS Shabana's teams had filed a complaint and whether I had informed the system about it. I would like to clarify that I had gone for team training, and during that time, her teams shared that they were highly disturbed by AS Shabana's behavior and habits, and they were fed up. Then, I informed UCOO Nizamuddin that the CHWs had complaints about their AS, and I requested him to listen to their complaints and find a solution. Shabana's teams had also formally submitted their complaint to UCOO Nizamuddin in writing.

4. Conclusion

The allegations against UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin are partially substantiated, with evidence suggesting instances of insensitivity and a lack of tact in communication. However, the most severe claims remain inconclusive due to insufficient corroboration.

The complaints also expose significant management issues within the UC, particularly concerning AS Ms. Shabana's behavior, which contributed to a toxic work environment and affected team dynamics.

5. Recommendations:

Based on the findings of the investigation, the team recommends the following actions:

Against UCOO Mr. Nizamuddin: Issue a formal warning for unprofessional remarks made during contract distribution. **As per (PTPPSR) Annex-7 B: Disciplinary Action in case of Performance Table - 1: Disciplinary/ Accountability Framework/ Capacity Issues - Amber line Areas/ 4 • Unprofessional or Casual Behavior towards peers/colleagues.**

Against AS Ms. Shabana: Implement immediate suspension and issue a show cause letter for data manipulation, misuse of authority, and unprofessional behavior. **As per**

(PTPPSR) Annex-7 B: Disciplinary Action in case of Performance Table - 1: Disciplinary/ Accountability Framework/Gross Misconduct - Red Line Area/1 • Data fudging and Sub clause/ 6 Abuse of Authority.