

From: DEMEKE, Temesgen Atsedu [mailto:demeket@who.int]
Sent: Friday, December 18, 2020 2:17 PM
To: Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>
Cc: 'Naila Nizam' <naila@ctc.org.pk>; BUGTI, Muhammad Anwar <bugtim@who.int>; KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah <kasia@who.int>; 'Ayesha Naeem' <ayesha.naeem@ctc.org.pk>
Subject: RE: [EXT] Fw: Investigation report of fake finger marking reported in Gohorabad UC district Quetta during Nov NID 2020

I agree with you Sabeela. UCPO need written warning. Thanks

With Kind Regards

Temesgen A Demeke
Team Leader Balochistan
Polio Eradication initiative - WHO Pakistan
Serena Bazaar, Quetta
Email: demeke@who.int
Phone: +923003400530



From: Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>
Sent: Friday, December 18, 2020 12:25 PM
To: DEMEKE, Temesgen Atsedu <demeket@who.int>
Cc: 'Naila Nizam' <naila@ctc.org.pk>; BUGTI, Muhammad Anwar <bugtim@who.int>; KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah <kasia@who.int>; 'Ayesha Naeem' <ayesha.naeem@ctc.org.pk>
Subject: [EXT] Fw: Investigation report of fake finger marking reported in Gohorabad UC district Quetta during Nov NID 2020

Dear Sir,

With reference to subject cited above, this is to bring to your kind information that UCPO Goharabad – Mr. Waheed Shah has been reported for his poor supervisory skills. As per the findings of Ms. Amel, a CHW in UC Goharabad was involved in fake finger marking from the past 01 year. She didn't vaccinate 66 children but register them in her MC book. As a UC monitor, the aforementioned UCPO failed to perform his duty in a proper manner and couldn't highlight the fake finger marking issue.

Therefore, issuance of explanation followed by required disciplinary action in case of unsatisfactory response is recommended to UCPO Mr. Waheed Shah.

You are requested to share your kind feedback and approval regarding the same.

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks and Regards
Sabeela Pasha
Regional coordinator(Balochistan)

From: DEOC Quetta [<mailto:deocquetta@gmail.com>]
Sent: Thursday, December 17, 2020 10:43 PM
To: Asif Khan <asif@ctc.org.pk>; Sabeela <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>; Shamsullah Tareen <shams@ctc.org.pk>
Subject: Fwd: Fw: Investigation report of fake finger marking reported in Gohorabad UC district Quetta during Nov NID 2020

Dear ctc colleagues

In last forwarded email attached file was missed due to the file size exceeded.

Regards

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Dehani, Aasiya Bano <dehaniania@who.int>
Date: Thu, Dec 17, 2020, 8:25 PM
Subject: Fw: Investigation report of fake finger marking reported in Gohorabad UC district Quetta during Nov NID 2020
To: DEOC Quetta <deocquetta@gmail.com>

From: ALTAHER, Amel <aaltaher@who.int>
Sent: Tuesday, December 8, 2020 10:02 AM
To: DEMEKE, Temesgen Atsedu <demeket@who.int>
Cc: DAHIR, Ahmed <dahira@who.int>; SEIDA, Yahia <yseida@who.int>; BUGTI, Muhammad Anwar <bugtim@who.int>; Dehani, Aasiya Bano <dehaniania@who.int>
Subject: Investigation report of fake finger marking reported in Gohorabad UC district Quetta during Nov NID 2020

Dear Dr. Temesgen,

I want to bring to your notice that on 4th Dec during tehsil evening meeting district Quetta a lead monitor had reported that CHW 1290 in Gohorabad UC was found doing fake finger marking. on 5th & 6th Dec 2020 myself and Dr. Ahmed visited Gohorabad TSC for investigating the matter. We had a meeting with UC staff, two lead monitors, TDO and Quetta Area coordinator. The fake finger marking was reported by ALSM she discovered that 6 children in one house were fake finger marked.

- We met CHW Asyia 1290 who had been deployed in new area this round after district received additional 100 CHWs.

Main findings of the investigation:

1. We had detailed discussion with CHW to dig out the issue and get true picture about reported issue, according to CHW statement she had been doing fake finger marking for 141 children for one year (all these children are yellow highlighted in attached MC book)
2. Total of 66 children were not vaccinated but only registered vaccinated in MC book, she has been practicing since one-year (data fudging) copy is attached
3. Based on these data total of 207 Out of 342 children which represent 61% of her five days work was fake coverage for one year
4. one AFP was found by her but not reported (attached) according to her; she had been asked by Area supervisor 2335 to not report refusals, AFP or any other issue.
5. For vaccine management; CHW and AS had wasted the vaccine in ground in order to balance vaccinated children and vaccine wasted rate as per their statements
6. In the area where she was doing fake FM the new CHW Sabra had reported large number of refusals: in this round day 4: total of 11 refusals as compare to 02 in last round, day 5 total 17 as compared to 03 last campaign when we asked the new CHW for reason of increase refusals she told that they were asking for fake finger marking
7. Total of 10 houses having 45 children were validated, total of 23 (51%) were found fake finger marked by old team CHW Asyia 1290 and reported refusals this round by new CHW
 - total of 11 houses were validated in Killi banqulzai and lango street area total of 5 children were fake finger marked as per family statement by CHW 1314A
 - We checked 08 houses in Pirkani street out of 38 children five were fake finger marked by CHW Nadia 1303 Area supervisor Arifa 2335

Conclusion and recommendations:

What we found for us it is a criminal and alarming situation. the very negative attitude of FLWs it shows that dishonesty of team whom we thought because they are females having access into houses, they could be bringing the true picture in field.

With these findings we doubt in actual coverage of Quetta especially with continued positive human and environmental sites virus is showing that there are immunity gaps

Recommendations

1. Termination of two CHWs and area supervisor Sadam
2. Warning letter to be issued to UC polio lead, UCDO and UCCO
3. Displeasure letter to be issued to concerned district lead monitor who was assigned to support and supervise Gohorabad UC
4. There is need for field validation/assessment for all houses in Gohorabad UC
5. More widening detailed investigation on different areas in Quetta district to see scope of fake finger marking
6. Quality of monitors at both UC and district level to be regularly evaluated
7. Proper training of FLWs with emphasize on reported field realities
8. Communication team to design community approaches based on community needs.

Regards,
Amel

