

## **INVESTIGATION REPORT REGARDING ISSUES IDENTIFIED IN MONITORING**

### **AT UC LOESUM**

#### **INVESTIGATION COMMITTEE MEMBERS:**

1. Dr. Walid Hassan (PEO-WHO Bajour)
2. Dr. Mohammad Rabbani (FSMO-Bajour)

#### **Time and Location of Incidence:**

On 2<sup>nd</sup> December 2020 (0700-1600), CHC Loesum, Tehsil Khar, Bajour.

#### **ALLEGATIONS/ INQUIRY HYPOTHESIS: (Implicit/Explicit)**

1. Desk & field analysis and validation of the ICM Clusters taken by TCSP and UCPO
2. Compromised monitoring by the monitoring tier at UC level
3. Lack of professionalism & irrationalized attitude of the AIC Mr. Mohammad Luqman
4. Persistent low indicators in Intra-campaign phase (notified by DEOC)

#### **PARTIES AND PERSONS INVOLVED:**

1. Mr. Mohammad Tariq (TCSP Khar)
2. Mr. Sardar Dawood (UCPO Loesum)
3. Mr. Mohammad Luqman (AIC-Loesum-9/ Medical Technician)

#### **Background/ Context:**

On 01<sup>st</sup> December 2020 (2<sup>nd</sup> Day of NID December 2020), the provincial polio eradication Officer (PPEO) Dr. Waheed Kamran and the rapid response unit officer (RRU Officer) Dr. Qaisar Ahmad visited the UC Loesum, for supportive supervision of the human resource involved in the NID December 2020 for the monitoring of the NID December 2020 activities. During the visit issues were observed in clusters of the monitors. Similarly, the AIC Mr. Mohammad luqman, left the CHC without permission and took tally sheet and data along with himself to home. After identification of such gross negligence, the issues were further probed, and initial investigation was conducted from the concerned staff members and health care facility in-charge. The PPEO & RRU Officer submitted

the findings to the DEOC and a committee was constituted for qualitative and quantitative analysis of the issue, committee was also tasked to check other aspects of the monitoring and the concerned AIC, documentations, descriptive & inferential variances and inference the outcomes to the DEOC for transparent & strict accountability under the accountability framework:

**Facts and Findings:**

As per the analysis & validation on both the desk and field evidences, some gaps/ weaknesses identified are as under:

1. The first cluster taken by TCSP Mr. Mohammad Tariq against the team-2, of Loesum area-1 (Village- Loesum Daag), AIC- Mr. Nasir Khan, was validated and the following issues were observed during the desk and field analysis:
  - A. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on tally sheet the house # 12 is locked), but in ICM Cluster the house has target of two children. Where, both the children were above 12 months. Upon field validation it was observed that the findings of the tally sheet and team were authentic and true (Mean of verification/Validation Attached-Annexure-A)
  - B. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on tally sheet the house # 13, has target of two children (containing one below 12-month child & one above-12 months child), but in ICM Cluster both the children were above 12 months. Upon field validation it was observed that the findings of the tally sheet and team were authentic and true (Mean of verification/Validation Attached-Annexure-B)
  - C. No Signature of monitor on the ICM Cluster form
  
2. The second cluster taken by TCSP Mr. Mohammad Tariq against the team-1, of Loesum area-2 (Village- Khatako Shah), AIC- Mr. Imdad Ullah, was validated where the following issues were observed during the desk and field analysis
  - A. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on tally sheet the house # 14 has 04 NA children. The information mentioned in tally sheet shows that two children went to karachi, and two went to hospital. But in ICM all 04 NA went to

Chakwal. Upon field validation it was observed that the findings of the tally sheet and team were authentic and true.

- B. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on tally sheet the house # 10 & house#11 has issue in assigning the house number on door and tally sheet but in ICM Cluster both the houses were matching the door marking. Upon field validation it was observed that the findings of the door marking & ICM cluster were authentic and true and error was observed in tally sheet AIC (Mean of verification/Validation Attached-Annexure-C). However, one new TVBCM guest child named Iqra D/O Hafiz Ullah was found and vaccinated by the PEO, FSMO & AIC (Mean of verification/Validation Attached-Annexure-D)
  - C. No Signature of monitor on the ICM Cluster form
3. The first cluster taken by UCPO Mr. Sardar Dawood against the team-3, of Loesum area-9 (Village- loe jowar), AIC- Mr. Mohammad Luqman, was validated where the following issues were observed during the desk and field analysis:
    - A. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on tally sheet the house # 08 & house # 06 has target of 05 and 07 children respectively, but in ICM cluster the age bifurcation showed different statistics. Upon field validation it was observed that the findings of the tally sheet and team were authentic and true.
    - B. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on ICM Cluster the house # 11, 01 missed child was observed, but no reason of missing was not mentioned.
    - C. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that the cluster was not giving information of NA Children in House # 12 & House # 09.
    - D. No Signature of monitor on the ICM Cluster form
  4. The second cluster taken by UCPO Mr. Sardar Dawood against the team-1, of Loesum area-9 (Village- Gulukas), AIC- Mr. Mohammad Luqman, was validated where the following issues were observed during the desk and field analysis:
    - A. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on tally sheet the house # 05 has target of 03 children, but in ICM cluster the different statistics were observed showing only one child in the target. Upon field validation it was observed that the

findings of the tally sheet and team were authentic and true. (Mean of verification/Validation Attached-Annexure-E)

- B. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that on tally sheet the house # 18, 03 NA were observed, but in ICM Cluster 02 NA were observed.
  - C. Upon comparison and analysis on desk, it was revealed that the cluster was not giving information of single NA Child
  - D. No Signature of monitor on the ICM Cluster form
5. The AIC of Loesum-09, Mr. Mohammad Luqman-Medical Technician was interrogated, and his performance was also evaluated. Moreover, the UCMO was also involved during his performance evaluation and validation
- A. It was observed that the micro census of the Loesum-9 is neither updated, which was assigned to the AIC Mr. Mohammad Luqman, nor the micro census were validated by any of the monitor
  - B. He left the center without informing the first-line supervisor-UCMO
  - C. Left Form-2A at center and did not discussed the statistics and team outcome with the UCMO
  - D. Took tally sheets to his home and didn't bothered to take permission from the external monitors & UCMO
  - E. During the field visit, various issues were observed in teams and area of Loesum-9. I.e. in tally sheet filling, maps were missing, breach of COVID-19 SOPs & Utilization of old Micro census Etc.
2. The supportive supervision by the TCSP, UCPO & SM was observed both on desk and in field, where much melancholically it was revealed that the monitoring tier was performing the duty as formality. Overall tally sheets of 07 areas containing 21 mobile teams were evaluated for two days work. Where, only one tally sheet contained issues identification out of 21 tally sheets, contributing 0.41% of supportive supervision to the UC Loesum as shown in the table No.01.

S. No.	NAME	DESIGNATION	AREA	TEAM No	SIGNATURE (Y/N)	FINDINGS (Supportive supervision provided)	DAY OF WORK
1	Javid	SM	L2	1	Y	NIL	1st
2	Dawood	UCPO	L9	1	Y	NIL	1st
3	Dawood	UCPO	L9	2	Y	NIL	1st
4	Dawood	UCPO	L9	3	Y	NIL	1st
5	Javid	SM	L3	2	Y	NIL	1st
6	Ayyub	SM	L5	2	Y	NIL	1st
7	Ayyub	SM	L6	3	Y	NIL	2nd
8	Ayyub	SM	L7	2	Y	NIL	2nd
9	Javid	SM	L10	2	Y	NIL	2nd
10	Dawood	UCPO	L10	2	Y	NIL	2nd
11	Javid	SM	L9	3	Y	NIL	2nd
12	Dawood	UCPO	L9	1	Y	FINDING WRITTEN NO ZERO DOSE, NO AFP	2nd
13	Tariq	TCSP	L2	1	Y	NIL	2nd
14	Tariq	TCSP	L2	2	Y	NIL	2nd
15	Tariq	TCSP	L1	2	Y	NIL	2nd

TABLE: NO. 01: Visits by the Monitors in UC Loesum (Area# 1-7)

- No team monitoring checklist was not filled by AIC as 3 out of 10 AICs were validated in the field and all were short of team monitoring checklist, area loeum-9 was monitored were the old micro census were used, compromised monitoring, lack of coordination meetings and poor accountability. Moreover, 47 locked houses were observed in the three days work

**Methodology:**

- A team was constituted, nominated, and notified for the investigation and inquiry.
- A team of public health professionals (two-membered) critically investigated the issue.
- A visit to CHC Loesum was conducted by the team, where the ICM Cluster, tally sheets, form 2A, Form 2B and field was critically evaluated, and staff was probed accordingly.

4. Qualitative analysis, In-depth Interviews were conducted from MT Mr. Mohammad Luqman and UCMO Dr. Shahzaib, where the information was coded and themed accordingly to get the perfect extract.
5. Quantitative analysis, Descriptive information including ICM clusters, supportive Supervision material/ notes, form 2A, form 2B and field evidences were collected as prime evidence in the issue.
6. The Quantitative and qualitative data was critically triangulated with the protocols and SOPs
7. Hard documents from desk and pictorial evidences from field were collected for quality assurance\*.
8. A detailed report copy will be disseminated to the concerned departments and key stakeholders
9. All the ethical considerations, transparency and confidentiality were maintained throughout the inquiry process.

**\*(Limitation: No written statements were included)**

### **Recommendations:**

Considering the facts and findings collected from the data and analysis techniques triangulations, the following recommendations are recommended, in the better interest of the community, health system management, health system strengthening, and programmatic objective achievement;

1. Both the monitors clusters showed negligence in the authenticity and information collected, as both the monitors TCSP & UCPO are having programmatic experience of 09 years each respectively. Similarly, they are well oriented about the SOPs, which signifies that they have shown Non-professional attitude and have shown absolute negligence to TORs. It is recommended that both should be dealt strictly under the organizational accountability framework, looking at the level of breach the following actions are recommended:
  - A. As per organizational SOPs/ policies there is zero tolerance to the data fudging, and as per findings the contents of fudging are observed. Similarly, lack of supportive supervision was observed, only signatures were found on the tally sheets as formality. Therefore, the penalty (TERMINATION) of the

fake data submission and breaching of SOPs should be awarded to the said TCSP

- B. The UCPO's finding shows weakness in completeness of the cluster. Similarly, lack of supportive supervision was observed, only signatures were found on the tally sheets as formality indicating lack of interest. Therefore, the penalty (WARNING) of the lack of interest, breach of SOPs should be awarded to the said UCPO.
2. The MT Mr. Mohammad Luqman should be dealt strictly under E & D rules, and should be made accountable, and a Show Cause/ Charge
  3. Shuffling of the monitors is requested in the better interest of the programmatic objectives and benchmark achievement subject to approval from the provincial. desk
  4. The DEOC should propose a strong supportive action plan for the UC Loesum
  5. Detailed validation of the micro census should be conducted in the UC Loesum
  6. A detailed capacity building training should be conducted for all the monitors to ensure absolute capacity building of both the WHO & CommNet teams

(P.T.O for Annexure)

**Profound Regards**

Annexure A







Annexure B



Annexure-C



Annexure-D



Annexure-E

