

From: DAHIR, Ahmed [mailto:dahira@who.int]
Sent: Friday, January 1, 2021 3:18 PM
To: Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>
Cc: 'Naila Nizam' <naila@ctc.org.pk>; KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah <kasia@who.int>; BUGTI, Muhammad Anwar <bugtim@who.int>; DEMEKE, Temesgen Atsedu <demeket@who.int>; Dehani, Aasiya Bano <dehania@who.int>; IQBAL, Arsalan <aiqbal@who.int>; 'Ayesha Naeem' <ayesha.naeem@ctc.org.pk>
Subject: RE: [EXT] RE: Reply of explanation

Dear Sabeela,

Action should be taken as per SOPs.

Regards

Ahmed

Dr. Ahmed Dahir

Technical Officer – Balochistan

Polio Eradication Initiative – World Health Organization, Pakistan

Cell: +923000559476

Email: dahira@who.int

From: Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>
Sent: Wednesday, December 30, 2020 12:55 PM
To: DAHIR, Ahmed <dahira@who.int>
Cc: 'Naila Nizam' <naila@ctc.org.pk>; KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah <kasia@who.int>; BUGTI, Muhammad Anwar <bugtim@who.int>; DEMEKE, Temesgen Atsedu <demeket@who.int>; Dehani, Aasiya Bano <dehania@who.int>; IQBAL, Arsalan <aiqbal@who.int>; 'Ayesha Naeem' <ayesha.naeem@ctc.org.pk>
Subject: RE: [EXT] RE: Reply of explanation

Dear Sir,

With reference to below placed email regarding Explanation reply of Mr. Waheed Shah. The staff has issued explanation letter on account of weak monitoring and supervision skills.

The staff has shared his reply he negated all the allegations levelled against him and stated that he himself is the first person who reported this case(fake finger marking) and updated and informed you .

And for AFP case he stated that no one reported him about this case that's why he did not update further.

PEO also shared his remarks endorsing comments of UC lead Waheed shah.

And further stated that AFP case didn't report to him and he was the first one who reported me fake finger marking in NID November.

AS also shared her remarks and she stated that Waheed is an experienced and hardworking UCPO but this negligence is proven in attached report for all the UC level staff UCPO,UCDO and UCCO .We all are accountable at all levels please Proceed with recommended warning by district. I hope all of them will improve.

In the light of aforementioned case it is recommended to issue him warning on account of weak monitoring and supervision skills.

The email is being send to you for your kind information and kind remarks.

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks and Regards

Sabeela Pasha

Regional coordinator(Balochistan)

From: Dehani, Aasiya Bano [<mailto:dehania@who.int>]
Sent: Wednesday, December 30, 2020 10:13 AM
To: Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>

Cc: 'Naila Nizam' <naila@ctc.org.pk>; KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah <kasia@who.int>; BUGTI, Muhammad Anwar <bugtim@who.int>; Lubna Adnan RAKHSHANI <rakhshanil@who.int>; IQBAL, Arsalan <aiqbal@who.int>; israrmalik2@hotmail.com; 'Ayesha Naeem' <ayesha.naeem@ctc.org.pk>
Subject: RE: [EXT] RE: Reply of explanation

Dear Sabeela.

We know Waheed is an experienced and hard working UCPO but this negligence is proven in attached report for all the UC level staff UCPO,UCDO and UCCO .We all are accountable at all levels please Proceed with recommended warning by district.

I hope all of them will improve

We always learn with mistakes we are always here to support

Regards

Dr Aasiya Bano

Dear Dr. Temesgen,

I want to bring to your notice that on 4th Dec during tehsil evening meeting district Quetta a lead monitor had reported that CHW 1290 in Goharabad UC was found doing fake finger marking. on 5th & 6th Dec 2020 myself and Dr. Ahmed visited Goharabad TSC for investigating the matter. We had a meeting with UC staff, two lead monitors, TDO and Quetta Area coordinator. The fake finger marking was reported by ALSM she discovered that 6 children in one house were fake finger marked.

- We met CHW Asyia 1290 who had been deployed in new area this round after district received additional 100 CHWs.

Main findings of the investigation:

1. We had detailed discussion with CHW to dig out the issue and get true picture about reported issue, according to CHW statement she had been doing fake finger marking for 141 children for one year (all these children are yellow highlighted in attached MC book)
2. Total of 66 children were not vaccinated but only registered vaccinated in MC book, she has been practicing since one-year (data fudging) copy is attached
3. Based on these data total of 207 Out of 342 children which represent 61% of her five days work was fake coverage for one year

4. one AFP was found by her but not reported (attached) according to her; she had been asked by Area supervisor 2335 to not report refusals, AFP or any other issue.
5. For vaccine management; CHW and AS had wasted the vaccine in ground in order to balance vaccinated children and vaccine wasted rate as per their statements
6. In the area where she was doing fake FM the new CHW Sabra had reported large number of refusals: in this round day 4: total of 11 refusals as compare to 02 in last round, day 5 total 17 as compared to 03 last campaign when we asked the new CHW for reason of increase refusals she told that they were asking for fake finger marking
7. Total of 10 houses having 45 children were validated, total of 23 (51%) were found fake finger marked by old team CHW Asyia 1290 and reported refusals this round by new CHW
 - total of 11 houses were validated in Killi banqulzai and lango street area total of 5 children were fake finger marked as per family statement by CHW 1314A
 - We checked 08 houses in Pirkani street out of 38 children five were fake finger marked by CHW Nadia 1303 Area supervisor Arifa 2335

Conclusion and recommendations:

What we found for us it is a criminal and alarming situation. the very negative attitude of FLWs it shows that dishonesty of team whom we thought because they are females having access into houses, they could be bringing the true picture in field.

With these findings we doubt in actual coverage of Quetta especially with continued positive human and environmental sites virus is showing that there are immunity gaps

Recommendations

1. Termination of two CHWs and area supervisor Sadam
2. Warning letter to be issued to UC polio lead, UCDO and UCCO
3. Displeasure letter to be issued to concerned district lead monitor who was assigned to support and supervise Gohorabad UC
4. There is need for field validation/assessment for all houses in Gohorabad UC
5. More widening detailed investigation on different areas in Quetta district to see scope of fake finger marking

6. Quality of monitors at both UC and district level to be regularly evaluated
7. Proper training of FLWs with emphasize on reported field realities
8. Communication team to design community approaches based on community needs.

Regards,
Amel

On Dec 24, 2020 10:18 AM, Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk> wrote:

Dear Dr. Asia ,

With reference to below placed email regarding Explanation reply of Mr. Waheed Shah. The staff has issued explanation letter on account of weak monitoring and supervision skills.

The staff has shared his reply he negated all the allegations levelled against him and stated that he himself is the first person who reported this case(fake finger marking) and updated and informed you .

And for AFP case he stated that no one reported him about this case that's why he did not update further.

PEO also shared his remarks endorsing comments of UC lead Waheed shah.

And further stated that AFP case didn't report to him and he was the first one who reported me fake finger marking in NID November.

You are requested to share your remarks and comments so that further process will be taken accoridngly.

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks and Regards

Sabeela Pasha

Regional coordinator(Balochistan)

From: IQBAL, Arsalan [<mailto:aiqbal@who.int>]

Sent: Thursday, December 24, 2020 9:35 AM

To: Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>

Cc: 'Naila Nizam' <naila@ctc.org.pk>; KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah <kasia@who.int>; BUGTI, Muhammad Anwar <bugtim@who.int>; Dehani, Aasiya Bano <dehania@who.int>; Lubna Adnan RAKHSHANI <rakhshanil@who.int>; israrmalik2@hotmail.com; 'Ayesha Naeem' <ayesha.naeem@ctc.org.pk>

Subject: Re: [EXT] RE: Reply of explanation

Dear Sabeela!

Hope you are doing well.

I am endorsing comments of UC lead Waheed shah.

AFP case didint report to him and he was the first one who reported me fake finger marking in NID November.

Regards!

On Dec 23, 2020 4:31 PM, Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk> wrote:

Dear Dr. Arsalan,

With reference to below placed email regarding Explanation reply of Mr. Waheed Shah. The staff has issued explanation letter on account of weak monitoring and supervision skills.

Your comments are still awaited .please share your remarks so that further process will be taken accordingly.

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks and Regards

Sabeela Pasha

Regional coordinator(Balochistan)

From: Sabeela Pasha [<mailto:sabeela@ctc.org.pk>]

Sent: Monday, December 21, 2020 12:38 PM

To: 'Arsalan' <aigbal@who.int>

Cc: 'Naila Nizam' <naila@ctc.org.pk>; 'KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah' <kasia@who.int>; 'bugtim@who.int' <bugtim@who.int>; 'dehania@who.int' <dehania@who.int>; 'Arsalan' <aigbal@who.int>; 'Lubna Adnan RAKHSHANI' <rakhshanil@who.int>; 'israrmalik2@hotmail.com' <israrmalik2@hotmail.com>; 'Ayesha Naeem' <ayesha.naeem@ctc.org.pk>

Subject: RE: Reply of explanation

Dear Dr. Arsalan,

With reference to below placed email regarding Explanation reply of Mr.Waheed Shah. The staff has issued explanation letter on account of weak monitoring and supervision skills.

The staff has shared his reply and stated that he him self is the first person who reported this case(fake finger marking) and updated and infomred you .

And for AFP case he stated that no one reported him about this case that's why he did not update further.

Your comments and remarks are required on the reply of said staff so that further action will be taken accordingly.

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks and Regards

Sabeela Pasha

Regional coordinator(Balochistan)

From: Waheed Shah [<mailto:shahwaheed269@gmail.com>]

Sent: Saturday, December 19, 2020 11:55 AM

To: Sabeela Pasha <sabeela@ctc.org.pk>

Cc: Naila Nizam <naila@ctc.org.pk>; KASI, Arbab Niamat Ullah <kasia@who.int>; bugtim@who.int; dehania@who.int; Arsalan <aiqbal@who.int>; Lubna Adnan RAKHSHANI <rakhshanil@who.int>; israrmalik2@hotmail.com

Subject: Reply of explanation

Respected Mam,

I have received a reprimand letter related to my negligence from the duty. I was asked to write the explanation letter in that reprimand letter. Therefore, I am writing this letter of explanation as a reply to the reprimand letter I received yesterday.

Mam I want to justify that yes CHW was involved in fake finger marking and it is very hard to trace fake finger marking because if any CHW does fake marking first she make very good understanding with that family (that except of me dont tell any one if some one ask about children's vaccination, tell them yes our childs have been vaccinating.)

Now I want to tell you about this perticular case the CHW namely Asia 1290. How we (UCDO and me) tracked this fake finger marking? In SNID Sep, 2020 round The TTSP called me that there was a house whom she had doubt that CHW might be doing fake finger marking, I immediately informed our lead monitor Dr. Arslan (he is also PEO of the UC), so we visited that house and investigated that family there were 3 children, 2 were already vaccinated and 1 was NA in door marking, we asked that family let us vaccinate their children again they innitialy reffused but leter on agreed for vaccination. From that day the CHW Asia 1290 was in our observation after october round we changed her area and that area was given to CHW Shezadi 1215A, so in NID-Nov-20 round the ratio of refusals were increased as campare to prevoius rounds so UCDO and I asked to CHW Shezadi that what was the reason than she told that there was 9 to 10 houses who were demanding for fake fingar marking when we heard this than we called AS Saddam and CHW Asia 1290 and investigated them. In our investigation CHW Asia 1290 admitted that yes she was doing so and we asked them did your supervisor is aware of this, she told yes he knew and we asked to AS Saddam did he aware of this he said no he was not aware.

Then I immediately reported to PEO Dr. Arslan that we tracked the CHW Asia 1290 whom you advised us to keep her in observation and she herself was addmiting that yes she was doing fake finger marking.

Mam for your kind information that we were the first (UCDO and Me) to tracked this fake fingar marking, as we found her guilty I reported her .

Secondly the AFP was not reported to me at all so how could I report it.

Mam I have been serving my duties for 7 years cincerely and honestly and had never ever led down my higher staff.

Despite above explanations if you feel that there was my negligence from work i apologize and I will correct my behavior as you guide me and will never give you chance an other explanation. Please accept my heartiest apologize.

Regards

Syed waheed sultan

Ucpo Goharabad

On Fri, 18 Dec 2020, 5:06 pm Sabeela Pasha, <sabeela@ctc.org.pk> wrote:

Dear Mr. Waheed ,

Please find in the attached file your Explanation letter on account of weak monitoring and supervision skills.

Please share your reply within 48 hours. kindly acknowledge as you receive the letter.

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks and Regards

Sabeela Pasha

Regional coordinator(Balochistan)