

## Shahid Ali

---

**From:** AHMAD SHAH, Mumtaz Khan <muahmad@who.int>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, November 6, 2019 2:07 PM  
**To:** Shahid Ali  
**Cc:** MOHAMED, Gedi; KAMRAN, Waheed; ABBAS, Waseem; KHAN, Faizan  
**Subject:** RE: Inquiry report on fake finger marking in UC Dehrai  
**Attachments:** UCPO Clusters.zip

Dear Shahid Ali,

After your queries I tried to search for the clusters and this searching took some time because the committee members who had these were not available in the district. Now I have found some of the clusters for your use.

Kindly note that at that time there was divisional set up in our province and after discussion with my seniors the report was shared directly with them.

The name of TCSP is Mr. Ziaur Rahman while UCPO name is Mr. Lal Badshah. As the contracts of the UCPOs and TCSPs are on these areas hence by naming the UC the officials concerned automatically finds the name of the responsible monitor hence were not mentioned in the report.

Secondly our own technical analysis is given in the inquiry report as I was supervising the inquiry committee.

In the attach file one cluster taken was not matching the ground realities while in next visit the same UCPO presented other clusters which were different from the previous. The door marking marked as correct doesn't match the ground realities while changed in other clusters. More over the ground realities could only be understood by the person who visit the area. If you need to probe in detail a visit can be arranged to the area to have a deep insight into the ground realities. One thing should be noted that we didn't collect much more evidence because we thought that some houses in the cluster not matching the ground and then changing the cluster by the UCPO warrants disciplinary action.

However it's up to you to proceed further as per SOPs.

**Profound Regards,**  
**From The Desk Of,**  
**Dr. Mumtaz Khan**  
**Area Coordinator Bajour Mohmand.**  
**Cell # 03339322149**  
**03471001998**  
**Email: [muahmad@who.int](mailto:muahmad@who.int)**  
**[acbajourmohmand@gmail.com](mailto:acbajourmohmand@gmail.com)**  
**[mumtaz\\_salarzai@yahoo.com](mailto:mumtaz_salarzai@yahoo.com)**

---

**From:** Shahid Ali [mailto:shahidali@ctc.org.pk]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, November 05, 2019 2:53 PM  
**To:** AHMAD SHAH, Mumtaz Khan <muahmad@who.int>  
**Cc:** MOHAMED, Gedi <mohamedge@who.int>; KAMRAN, Waheed <kamranw@who.int>; ABBAS, Waseem <wabbas@who.int>; KHAN, Faizan <khanfai@who.int>  
**Subject:** RE: Inquiry report on fake finger marking in UC Dehrai

Soft Reminder!

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks & Regards,  
Shahid Ali

Regional Coordinator KP & KPTD-PTPP  
Chip Training & Consulting (Pvt) Ltd.

---

**From:** Shahid Ali [<mailto:shahidali@ctc.org.pk>]  
**Sent:** Thursday, October 24, 2019 3:12 PM  
**To:** 'AHMAD SHAH, Mumtaz Khan' <[muahmad@who.int](mailto:muahmad@who.int)>  
**Cc:** 'MOHAMED, Gedi' <[mohamedge@who.int](mailto:mohamedge@who.int)>; 'kamranw@who.int' <[kamranw@who.int](mailto:kamranw@who.int)>; 'ABBAS, Waseem' <[wabbas@who.int](mailto:wabbas@who.int)>; 'KHAN, Faizan' <[khanfai@who.int](mailto:khanfai@who.int)>  
**Subject:** RE: Inquiry report on fake finger marking in UC Dehrakai

Dear Dr. Mumtaz,

With reference to below email regarding fake finger marking case of Lal Badshah UCPO and Negligence of TCSP.

1. It is requested to provide Fake clusters he has taken, evidences of poor supportive supervision, if any and being a supervisor and technical person kindly share your analysis regarding the cluster he has presented initially and after.
2. Kindly share the name of concern TCSP and evidences which shows his negligence.

Moreover, it requested to share such cases directly with CTC in timely manner.

Your prompt response will be highly appreciated in this regard.

In case if you need any further assistance regarding the same, Please let us know.

Thanks & Regards,  
Shahid Ali  
Regional Coordinator KP & KPTD-PTPP  
Chip Training & Consulting (Pvt) Ltd.

---

**From:** AHMAD SHAH, Mumtaz Khan [<mailto:muahmad@who.int>]  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 22, 2019 12:50 PM  
**To:** 'Shahid Ali' <[shahidali@ctc.org.pk](mailto:shahidali@ctc.org.pk)>; ABBAS, Waseem <[wabbas@who.int](mailto:wabbas@who.int)>  
**Cc:** KAMRAN, Waheed <[kamranw@who.int](mailto:kamranw@who.int)>  
**Subject:** FW: Inquiry report on fake finger marking in UC Dehrakai

Respected W. Abbas & Shahid Ali Salam,  
I am forwarding a self- explanatory report on the subject cited above. The DPCR Bajour has recommended termination of contract of UCPO and Social Mobilizer. Kindly proceed as per the SOPs and let us know about the proceedings when started.

**Profound Regards,**  
**From The Desk Of**  
**Dr. Mumtaz Khan**  
**Area Coordinator Bajour Mohmand.**  
**Cell # 03339322149**  
**03471001998**  
**Email: [muahmad@who.int](mailto:muahmad@who.int)**

**From:** AHMAD SHAH, Mumtaz Khan  
**Sent:** Friday, September 20, 2019 11:14 AM  
**To:** KHURSHID, Muhammad Naveed <[khurshidm@who.int](mailto:khurshidm@who.int)>  
**Subject:** Fwd: Inquiry report on fake finger marking in UC Dehrakai

Dear Sir salam.

For your information and comments please

----- Forwarded message -----

From: "AHMAD SHAH, Mumtaz Khan" <[muahmad@who.int](mailto:muahmad@who.int)>

Date: 6 Sep 2019 9:11 p.m.

Subject: Inquiry report on fake finger marking in UC Dehrakai

To: "KHURSHID, Muhammad Naveed" <[khurshidm@who.int](mailto:khurshidm@who.int)>

Cc: "KAMRAN, Waheed" <[kamranw@who.int](mailto:kamranw@who.int)>, Nazir AHMAD <[ahmadnaz@who.int](mailto:ahmadnaz@who.int)>, "ABBAS, Waseem" <[wabbas@who.int](mailto:wabbas@who.int)>, "HASSAN, Walid" <[hassanw@who.int](mailto:hassanw@who.int)>, Burhanuddin SALARZAI <[salarzaib@who.int](mailto:salarzaib@who.int)>

Dear Sir salam,

It is for your kind information that fake finger marking were identified in UC Dehrakai in 8 houses in the recently conducted SNID/CR campaign. Upon probing it was revealed that the team did fake finger marking while the Area supervisor didn't visit the team in all the four days. Furthering probing revealed that the UCPO and social mobilizer took fake clusters in the area and TCSP didn't visit the area in last 7 rounds. The investigating committee recommended disciplinary action against all those responsible. The recommendation included termination of services to the team members, Area Supervisor, UCPO and Social mobilizer while final warning for the TCSP. Detail report issued from the office of deputy commissioner is for your information and further necessary action please.

Regards,

Dr.Mumtaz Khan.

Area Coordinator Bajour Mohmand.