

naveed.haider@chipconsulting.org

From: ALI, Asif [asifa@who.int]
Sent: Monday, July 4, 2022 9:12 AM
To: Naveed Haider
Cc: Naila Nizam; SAHITIA, Sundeep; DURRANI, Saima; Raazia Rehman
Subject: RE: [EXT] Re: FW: Discrepancy in the validation data deliberated by UCPO Ms Erum, District Korangi
Attachments: image001.png; image002.png

Thanks Naveed for following up the matter.
Kindly proceed.
Regards
Asif

From: Naveed Haider <naveed.haider@chipconsulting.org>
Sent: Friday, 1 July 2022 3:42 pm
To: ALI, Asif <asifa@who.int>
Cc: Naila Nizam <naila.nizam@chipconsulting.org>; SAHITIA, Sundeep <sathias@who.int>; DURRANI, Saima <durransa@who.int>; Raazia Rehman <raazia.rehman@chipconsulting.org>
Subject: [EXT] Re: FW: Discrepancy in the validation data deliberated by UCPO Ms Erum, District Korangi

Dear Dr Asif,

In the continuation to the below emails, its is recommended to issue **Show Cause letter on account of fake data reporting** to UCPO Ms Erum Fatima followed by disciplinary action if her response found to be unsatisfactory.

Your kind approval is requested in this regard.

Regards,
Naveed Haider
Project Officer-PTPP
CHIP Training & Consulting - Sindh
Cell: 03408444500

On 2022-06-28 13:04, ALI, Asif wrote:

Dear Ms. Naila,

Below is for your information and necessary action.

If you need any additional information on the subject please feel free to contact with PO.

Regards

Asif

From: SAHITIA, Sundeep <sathias@who.int>
Sent: Friday, 24 June 2022 9:58 pm
To: ALL, Asif <asifa@who.int>; BASIT, Qazi Abdul <basitq@who.int>; naveed.haider@chipconsulting.org;
naila@ctc.org.pk
Cc: SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal <shakeelk@who.int>
Subject: RE: Discrepancy in the validation data deliberated by UCPO Ms Erum, District Korangi

Dear **Dr. Asif**,

Thanks for the correspondence.

As per your directions; following process was followed:

Meeting with UCPO Ms. Erum was held dated 24.06.2022 along with Dr. Kanwal IO Korangi, & Dr. Qazi Basit (DDPO Korangi):

- UCPO Ms. Erum initially denied the findings of investigation results and instead alleged that ALSM forced her to enter fake data entry
- She maintained that these fake coverage data entries were done as typo errors

Field Validation of the 2 entries (disputed) was done dated 24.06.2022

(Members:

Dr. Sundeep PPEO,

Mr. Ehsan Mahar PTO,

Dr. Qazi Basit DDPO,

Dr. Kanwal IO in the presence of Ms. Erum UCPO & ALSM Mr. Ibaad)

Key Observations:

- Grand parents / households recognized Dr. Kanwal but could not recognize Ms. Erum
- Mentioned data of Ms. Erum also did not match in the field as is highlighted by Dr. Kanwal
- There was no issue of restriction by any of household as was highlighted by Ms. Erum
- The highlighted points by District Staff are exactly the points of concern

The comments are added for your final feedback Sir.

Regards,

Dr. Sundeep Sahitia

PPEO Sindh

From: ALI, Asif <asifa@who.int>
Sent: Wednesday, June 22, 2022 9:53 AM
To: BASIT, Qazi Abdul <basitq@who.int>; naveed.haider@chipconsulting.org; naila@ctc.org.pk
Cc: SAHITIA, Sundeep <sathias@who.int>; SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal <shakeelk@who.int>; JADOON, Nadeem Khan <jadoonn@who.int>; Korangi <koranginstop@gmail.com>; nstopkorangi@gmail.com
Subject: Re: Discrepancy in the validation data deliberated by UCPO Ms Erum, District Korangi

Dear Dr Sundeep,

Look into matter

Regards'

asif

From: BASIT, Qazi Abdul <basitq@who.int>
Sent: Wednesday, June 22, 2022 9:30 AM
To: naveed.haider@chipconsulting.org <naveed.haider@chipconsulting.org>; naila@ctc.org.pk <naila@ctc.org.pk>
Cc: ALI, Asif <asifa@who.int>; SAHITIA, Sundeep <sathias@who.int>; SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal <shakeelk@who.int>; JADOON, Nadeem Khan <jadoonn@who.int>; Korangi <koranginstop@gmail.com>; nstopkorangi@gmail.com <nstopkorangi@gmail.com>
Subject: Discrepancy in the validation data deliberated by UCPO Ms Erum, District Korangi

Dear CTC Team,

Hope this email finds you well. This is to bring into your notification that Ms. Erum Fatima working as UCPO in Shah Faisal Town was assigned Bhutto Nagar UC06 Landhi town for cross validation of covered NA and Refusals. As per assigned task she had to validate 5 NAs and 5 refusals which were covered on catchup day 01 & 02. By mistake she entered wrong data of those validated children and mentioned them as fake coverage. But then once inquired by PDA she wrote an email for typo error and requested to make correction. The data is as given below copied from the online link:

Erum	UCPO	06-Jun-	KORANGI	LANDHI	BHUTTO NAGAR-	c1	53	Tayaba	Rafat	REF	YES	YES	YES	saima	14	2
------	------	---------	---------	--------	---------------	----	----	--------	-------	-----	-----	-----	-----	-------	----	---

		22			6												
Erum	UCPO	06-Jun-22	KORANGI	LANDHI	BHUTTO NAGAR-6	c1	82	maryum	mohsen	NA	YES	YES	YES	saima	14	2	

To check the validity of data the Immunization Officer validated the data on ground herself and when she asked the ALSM to get to those HH; he informed her that all other HH mentioned in her record were validated by Ms. Erum but these last two HH were just copied from tally sheet. The houses were then located and visited, and the findings were shared with the DEOC.

Ms.Erum was sent an email to justify her position; whereas she denied that data was collected from the field and not from the tally sheet; in return she said that Mr. Ebad (ALSM) insisted on taking the data from the tally sheet, despite that she visited the houses herself.

Further to this investigation, Ms. Erum was called at DEOC to justify her position. Dr. Qazi Abdul Basit -Area Coordinator, Dr. Kaleem Shaikh -NSTOP officer and Dr. Kanwal Shakeel- Immunization Officer jointly conducted this meeting.

She denied the allegation on her regarding mentioned children: However, discrepancy in data was identified on ground in the name of child mentioned on tally sheet and recorded by Ms. Erum on online sheet.

Handwritten notes on the top left of the page:

- 05
- 01
- 02
- 03
- 04
- 05
- 06
- 07
- 08
- 09
- 10
- 11
- 12
- 13
- 14
- 15
- 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- 21
- 22
- 23
- 24
- 25
- 26
- 27
- 28
- 29
- 30
- 31
- 32
- 33
- 34
- 35
- 36
- 37
- 38
- 39
- 40
- 41
- 42
- 43
- 44
- 45
- 46
- 47
- 48
- 49
- 50

The main table has multiple columns and rows. A blue arrow points to a row containing the number 48.

Below the main table, there are three summary tables. The first summary table has columns labeled 1, 2, 3, 4. The second summary table has columns labeled 1, 2, 3, 4. The third summary table has columns labeled 1, 2, 3, 4 and contains the following numbers:

57	60		
39	45		
2	15		

The second image shows another page of a handwritten table with similar columns and rows. The numbers in the rows are different from the first image. A blue horizontal line highlights a row in the middle of the table.

Below the main table, there are three summary tables. The first summary table has columns labeled 1, 2, 3, 4. The second summary table has columns labeled 1, 2, 3, 4. The third summary table has columns labeled 1, 2, 3, 4 and contains the following numbers:

0	60	60	
4	46	50	
11	4	15	

Mr. Ebad was also called at DEOC and in front of DEOC team and Ms. Erum, he was still on his point that Ms. Erum did not validate above-mentioned children physically.

Furthermore, there has been a chalking error noticed on the tally sheet and the door marking. In case it was validated it would have been easily picked by the individual. These findings have made us clear that the mentioned houses were not validated and were misreported.

You are requested to kindly look into the matter and take the necessary actions as per the guidelines.

Thanks

Regards,

--

Dr. Qazi Abdul Basit

MBBS, MSPH

Area Coordinator-World Health Organization

gazibasit@gmail.com

+92-3330532998

From: SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal <shakeelk@who.int>

Sent: Tuesday, June 21, 2022 1:04 AM

To: BASIT, Qazi Abdul <basitq@who.int>; Korangi <koranginstop@gmail.com>

Subject: Re: [EXT] Typing mistake

Dear Both,

Please find attached updated document on the same case.

Regards,

Dr. Kanwal Shakeel

From: SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal <shakeelk@who.int>
Sent: Monday, June 20, 2022 5:34 PM
To: BASIT, Qazi Abdul <basitq@who.int>; Korangi <koranginstop@gmail.com>
Subject: Re: [EXT] Typing mistake

Dear Both,

Please find below given statement and attachment for record and further action:

"Further to this investigation, Ms. Erum was called at DEOC to justify her position. Dr. Qazi Abdul Basit -Area Coordinator, Dr. Kaleem Shaikh -NSTOP officer and Dr. Kanwal Shakeel- Immunization Officer jointly conducted this meeting.

She denied the allegation on her regarding mentioned children:

um	UCPO	06-Jun-22	KORANGI	LANDHI	BHUTTO NAGAR-6	c1	53	Tayaba	Rafat	REF	YES	YES	YES	saima	14	29/6/22
Erum	UCPO	06-Jun-22	KORANGI	LANDHI	BHUTTO NAGAR-6	c1	82	maryum	mohsen	NA	YES	YES	YES	saima	14	28/6/22

However, discrepancy in data was identified on ground in the name of child mentioned on tally sheet and recorded by Ms. Erum on online sheet.

Mr. Ebad was also called at DEOC and in front of DEOC team and Ms. Erum , he was still on his point that Ms. Erum did not validate above-mentioned children physically.

Kindly take further necessary action".

Regards,

Dr. Kanwal Shakeel

Immunization Officer

District Korangi

From: Erum Fatima <erum.fatima0340@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, June 9, 2022 7:53 PM
To: SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal <shakeelk@who.int>
Cc: BASIT, Qazi Abdul <basitq@who.int>; JADOON, Nadeem Khan <jadoonn@who.int>
Subject: Re: [EXT] Typing mistake

Respected Madam

I have honor to submit my reply against your email that I reached at UC Bhutto Nagar, Landhi town by 11:00 am and left 2:30 pm.

No area incharge was available during the revalidation of N/A Refusal children only ALSM Ibad was there and he doesn't know about NAs even refusals addresses and I with him started searching the addresses using tallysheets. and he waste the time this way. He's gave wrong statement against me because I wasn't agreed to take clusters from tallysheets.
Infact

ALSM Ibad not reached the exact point or houses who already validate on daily basis.

Madam as you know my work and I do my 100% and just one thing put mistakenly on online sheet and that sheet was locked. In this regard already send email to Sir Nadeem (PDA) and concerned for correction.

Regards

Erum Fatima-UCPO

Dirg Colony-03

SFT

On Thu, 9 Jun 2022, 4:12 pm SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal, <shakeelk@who.int> wrote:

Dear Erum,

Hope this email finds you well. As per your email, I revalidated the mentioned children on ground along with ALSM Ibad. and found some discrepancies. Also Mr. Ibad said that you didn't visit these two children physically but just mentioned data from tally sheet.

Erum	UCPO	06-Jun-22	KORANGI	LANDHI	BHUTTO NAGAR-6	c1	53	Tayaba
Erum	UCPO	06-Jun-22	KORANGI	LANDHI	BHUTTO NAGAR-6	c1	82	maryum

Please justify your position.

Regards,

Dr. Kanwal Shakeel

Immunization Officer-WHO

District Korangi

From: Erum Fatima <erum.fatima0340@gmail.com>

Sent: Monday, June 6, 2022 3:33 PM

To: SHAKEEL AHMED, Kanwal <shakeelk@who.int>; BASIT, Qazi Abdul <basitq@who.int>; JADOON, Nadeem Khan <jadoonn@who.int>

Subject: [EXT] Typing mistake

Respected Seniors,

I want to say that today I assigned for landhi town for NA and Refusal Validation activity UC Bhutto Nagar C-1 Area Team no 14 Area incharge Saima. I validate all no major mistake found. My mistake I should type no but by mistake I types yes on fake finger marking so please change this I am thankful to you.

Regards

Erum Fatima

UCPO UC 03 Drigh Colony

Shah Faisal Town

District korangi